The East African Legislative Assembly met at 2.30p.m. in the County Hall, Nairobi, Kenya.

PRAYER

(The Speaker, Dr Margaret Nantongo Zziwa, in the Chair.)

The Assembly was called to order.
COMMUNICATION FROM THE CHAIR

The Speaker: Hon. Members, I want to inform you that the meeting between the Wakina Maama for Afrika and women EALA Members took place on Friday afternoon and the resolutions reached shall be communicated to you in due course.

Let me also mention that preparations for netball and football are going on. I want to thank the hon. Members for the preparations for this important activity of the Inter-Parliamentary integration arrangement.

Let me thank the netball team who played a match with Kenya County Leaders on Friday and I can say that thank you for showing the stamina we have. Our stamina remains unchallenged. (Applause) To the team captain and the members, thank you very much.

Perhaps as I conclude, let me mentioned that I have passed around a circular in lieu of Kasubi Tombs in Uganda. I will appreciate your support in this breath. Thank you very much.

PAPERS

The Chairperson of the Committee on Communications, Trade and Investment (Ms Angela Kizigha): Thank you, Madam Speaker. I beg to lay on table the report of the Committee on Communications, Trade and Investment on the on spot assessment of radio operations and ICT. I beg to lay, Madam Speaker.

The Speaker: Thank you very much, Chairperson of the Committee on Communications, Trade and Investment.

MOTION

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION OF THE ASSEMBLY URGING THE EAC COUNCIL OF MINISTERS TO CATALYZE ACTION TO COMBAT ACTION ON TRAFFICKING OF PERSONS IN THE EAST AFRICAN COMMUNITY

Ms Dora Byamukama (Uganda): Thank you, Madam Speaker. I beg to move that a motion to urge the EAC Council of Ministers to catalyze action to combat trafficking in persons in the East African Community be adopted by this House. I beg to move.


Ms Byamukama: Madam Speaker and hon. Members, the motion reads as follows:

“WHEREAS Article 6 of the Treaty provides for fundamental principles of the Community and in particular 6(d) provides for good governance, which includes recognition, promotion and
protection of human and people’s rights in accordance with the provisions of the African Charter on Human and People’s Rights;

AND WHEREAS the operational principles of the Community under Article 7 (2) of the Treaty provides that EAC Partner States undertake to abide by the principles of good governance including the rule of law, social justice and maintenance of universally accepted standards of human rights;

CONSIDERING THAT all EAC Partner States are signatories to the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially women and children- this is the trafficking in persons as follows:

The Republic of Burundi signed onto the UN Trafficking in Persons Protocol on 14th December, 2000;

The Republic of Kenya ratified it on the 5th January, 2005;

The Republic of Uganda signed onto the Protocol on 12th December, 2000;

The United Republic of Tanzania signed onto the Protocol on 13th December, 2000 and ratified it in May 2006;

AND NOTING that some EAC partner States have enacted specific and comprehensive laws that prohibit trafficking in persons;

FURTHER NOTING that Article 76 establishes a Common Market to which all East African Community Partner States have acceded and which inter alia provides for free movement of labor, goods, services, capital and the right of establishment;

OBSERVING THAT the EAC Customs Union and Common Market have increased trans- border movement of goods and persons and thus increasing the potential for persons to be trafficked within and without the EAC;

NOW THEREFORE this Assembly do resolve as follows:

(i) That all EAC partner States should ratify the UN Trafficking in Persons Protocol and enact specific and comprehensive legislation to address the crime of trafficking in persons;

(ii) To urge the Council of Ministers to institute mechanisms to address the crime of trafficking in persons expeditiously;

(iii) The Council of Ministers tables annually in the Assembly a status report on action taken by the EAC to combat trafficking in persons.” I beg to move.

The Speaker: Thank you very much, hon, Dora. You may proceed to justify your motion.
Ms Byamukama: Madam Speaker, I would like to start off with the definition of trafficking in persons and according to the Palermo Protocol, this means the transport of persons by means of coercion, deception or consent for the purpose of exploitation such as forced or consensual labor or prostitution.

Trafficking in persons also means the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion; of abduction; of deception; and of abuse of power. This is done by somebody who is in a position of vulnerability or in the case of giving out payments to achieve the consent of a person having control over another for purposes of exploitation.

Madam Speaker and hon. Members, as you will note, this particular protocol was targeted at assisting the women and children because in most cases, these are the vulnerable members of the community. But I would like to urge that because of greed and economic constraints, you find that even men are being trafficked. And as we all know, there are several instances where boats have been capsizing when people are trying to find their way into their developed economies.

Madam Speaker, this may not be viewed as trafficking in persons but most likely if you are to investigate, you may find that behind these boatloads of people, there are some organized criminals who have ensured that these people are able to access the developed world and thereafter, they are exploited.

This exploitation takes form in many ways, for example, the passports are taken away from these people; secondly, when they work, they are not paid their wages; and then thirdly, when they are women, these women can also be used as sex slaves. Therefore, this is a form of modern day slavery.

In the case of children, as was said earlier this week, the children are used mostly in plantations and one of our Members alluded to the fact that we do have children, for example, picking coffee.

Even within the Community, we have people who have been taken to the islands and they have had their travel documents taken away from them and they are used in the fishing industry, which makes them fail to escape this kind of trafficking in persons.

Madam Speaker, I would like to say something more about the issue of causes - some of the causes are really poverty based. A person feels very poor and feels that maybe if they are able to go overseas, they will be able to make a better living. And in some instances, these people are very desperate and they are conned by all kinds of gangster and upon arrival, they are forced into slavery and they are not able to return to their home countries. There are many stories of this nature.
There is also the issue of glorification of the developed world. We in Africa sometimes think that once you cross the Atlantic, you find riches and glory and, therefore, people do everything possible to get to this developed world.

Finally, Madam Speaker the other cause is greed. These are syndicates of people who are anxious to make money by all means and they are using the human labor or prostitution in order to make money.

In other instances, there are also body parts which are taken from these people. They may undergo some form of operation and some people have their body parts taken from them. The parts are transported and used elsewhere without a person understanding the implications or even if they were able to consent, this would still be exploitation.

Madam Speaker, at one time this House – in the Second Assembly- in the process of amending the Customs Union Act included the issue of body parts amongst the goods which should not be traded in in the East African Community. I hope this amendment passed and was assented to by the Heads of States because as we continue to trade, trade in human parts is becoming a very lucrative business and, therefore, this is one of the reasons why we should have comprehensive laws to ensure that we prevent trafficking in persons; we prosecute those who traffic the persons and we protect the victims of trafficking in persons.

Madam Speaker, I beg to move and I hope that all the Members of this august House will support this noble motion. Thank you.

(Applause)

The Speaker: Thank you very much, hon. Byamukama. Hon. Members, the motion on the floor is that the Assembly do resolve to urge the EAC Council of Ministers to catalyze action to combat trafficking in persons in the EAC. Debate is open.

Mr. Zein Abubakar (Kenya): Thank you very much, Rt hon. Speaker. I stand to support the motion and I would also like to thank hon. Dora Byamukama for bringing this motion that urges the Council of Ministers to develop specific interventions and an action plan that will ensure that our Community addresses this serious international challenge; crime and a problem.

Madam Speaker, firstly, I would like to address myself to the issue of crimes and under this Protocol actually targets the most vulnerable – those sections of our community that are most vulnerable. And as rightly as talked about by the mover of this motion, taking advantage of people who are suffering from acute poverty but also looking for a better livelihood for themselves.

But also, I would like to suggest, Madam Speaker that if you look at the literature that covers this ignorable business of trafficking in persons, you would see that many a times the criminal
gangs that are involved in trafficking are organized. So, we must not lose sight of that. This is organised crime.

Secondly, these organized criminal gangs do not only restrict themselves to trafficking people. They tend to go with other crimes when undertaking trafficking of people, which include drugs, small arms, operating places where flesh is sold, in other words, brothels. It also involves corrupting minors. But more seriously, it also includes blackmailing families.

And sometimes people who are being trafficked are put in a situation where they are willing to stay in that inhuman condition because they fear what could happen to their families. They are taken outside the continent of Africa and in those places where they have been taken, sometimes pressure is applied to them that if they report to the authorities, something will happen to their families back home.

Allow me Madam Speaker, to make just two points; one, this Protocol calls upon us to provide leadership to develop action plans that are based on a human rights approach so that when, for example, you encounter trafficked people, you should not treat them like criminals because they are already victims and survivors of a crime.

Therefore, it calls upon us to consider that: when we are in a situation where we find trafficked persons, we should develop policies and approaches that allow for and facilitate the return and acceptance of children who have been victims of cross border trafficking with regard to their safety. Rather than putting them in cells, we should consider, first of all securing their safety and put those who are minding them; are trafficking them in the cells. But the ones who are suffering particularly women and children, put them in a protective custody and look for ways of facilitating their safe return but also acceptance back in the community.

Lastly, Madam Speaker, we must also ensure that the trafficked persons are not punished for any offences or activities that are related to their having been trafficked, such as prostitution and all migration violations. There can be temptations particularly if you are interested in only security and legal approaches that these are people we have arrested while being involved in prostitution. You don’t want to know why they are involved in prostitution. Or you have arrested children and say, they were begging.

In Kenya somebody made reference in this august House last week that there were children – I think it was hon. Mumbi - who were forced to become beggars. They were trafficked and were forced to beg on the streets and in the evening the lords of trafficking would come and take the money and put them in deplorable conditions waiting for the following day to take them to the streets to beg again. So, this is not an imaginary problem. This is a problem that is already affecting us.

I read in the press that in the last two years, many trafficked people from Ethiopia were found dead in vehicles in Tanzania. They were sealed in containers while they were being trafficked
and many of them suffocated to death. So, we as a region are duty bound to address this problem adequately.

I thank you very much, Madam Speaker for giving me this opportunity to contribute to this important motion. Thank you.

The Speaker: I will take hon. Frederic Ngenzebuhoro.

Mr. Frederic Ngenzebuhoro (Burundi): Thank you, Rt hon. Speaker for allowing me to contribute to this very important motion. I want to fully support this motion because trafficking persons is a reality in our region and there is no reason to justify this slavery. It is unacceptable that a person can be bought just like you can buy a cow from the market. It is a shame.

Madam Speaker, all our countries - the EAC partner States have enacted different rules about this trafficking in persons but the enforcement is not there and it is unacceptable. We must enforce all these laws. They have ratified many international charters and protocols but once again what is lacking is enforcement.

Madam Speaker, allow me to share some information I got through a very important document – it is a report of 2013 by the US Department on the issue of trafficking in persons about each Partner State- Rwanda, Burundi, Tanzania, Uganda and Kenya.

About Burundi they said that no tourist from East Africa and the Middle East, teachers, police, prison officials escort girls in prostitution. (Laughter) It said business people escort girls for prostitution in Bujumbura as well as in Kenya, Uganda and Rwanda and take girls for various types of forced labor in Southern Burundi and Tanzania. Unfortunately that is the reality we have in Burundi. There is a criminal court which is called awaowu to the Burundians to punish those persons.

What about Rwanda? It said, Rwanda is a source, transit and destination country for women and children subjected to forced labor and sex trafficking. Madam Speaker, in Rwanda, older females offer very vulnerable young girls rooms and put them in prostitution to pay for their expenses. Imagine those older females go to get boys young girls from deep in the villages.

And it further said that Rwanda women and children are secretly transported to Kenya, Uganda, the Democratic Republic of Congo, Tanzania, Burundi, Zambia, South Africa, France, Netherlands, Malaysia and the United States where they are subjected to forced agricultural and slave labor but mainly forced into prostitution. Madam Speaker, Rwanda has also a role to punish such crime.

What about Tanzania? Tanzania is fourth in trafficking in persons. It said, girls are exported in sex trafficking in tourist areas within the country. Boys are subjected to forced labor primarily on farms but also in mines in the commercial sector and in sex trade.
First of all, Tanzania has enacted a law on trafficking of persons since 2008. The issue once again here is the enforcement especially Tanzania has failed to implement its National and Trafficking Action Plan. It hasn't conducted any action awareness campaign. That is the problem.

Don’t ask me about Uganda. Uganda is a source and destination country for men, women and children subjected to forced labor and for trafficking children from DRC, Rwanda, Burundi, Kenya, Tanzania and South Sudan. They are forced into prostitution in Uganda.

It said, Uganda women are attracted into forced prostitution in Malaysia after they are recruited to work as hair dressers, nannies or hotel staff. So many of those women transit through India, China and Thailand where they are subjected to prostitution before arriving in Malaysia.

Madam Speaker, I have read that information to show how the issue is very inacceptable in our region. I don’t want to go further than this. I just wish to congratulate hon. Dora for having brought in this important motion and in a few words, I want to say that I fully support this motion. Thank you.

**The Speaker:** I will take hon. Dr Ndahiro.

**Dr. James Ndahiro (Rwanda):** Thank you, Rt hon. Speaker. Let me also congratulate hon. Dora Byamukama for this important motion.

I want to support this motion and raise two critical issues which I want, if hon. Dora allows, I am going to draft two amendments to improve the motion.

Why do I want to do so? Hon. Speaker, I am speaking here for the people who are endangered in this region and those are the albinos. (Applause) The albino community is being murdered left, right and center in our Partner States and nothing concrete has so far been done to protect their lives.

If possible, we should add to this present motion a resolution requiring Partner States to put specific mechanisms in place to protect the people with albinism or albinos.

Two, they have been talking about trafficking in persons but there is also trafficking in vulnerable groups; people who are or live with disabilities and they are turned into professional beggars. I have seen this in Mombasa where people come from as far as Mtwala in Tanzania. Some of them live in containers - imagine the heat in Mombasa – people live in containers and they are taken out every morning to go and beg and every evening they are taken back into the containers. And that is the life they lead.

When they are coming to Mombasa, they are not told exactly what they are coming to do. They are told there are opportunities for making money which will make a difference in their lives.
Such kinds of environment for people who are already weak, who are not even able to run away even if an opportunity occurred, requires us not only to as the Council of Ministers to do something but also to emphasize that they should, together with security organs, make specific operations in our Partner States for people who are kept in containers or safe houses for different purposes because they are there.

Rt hon. Speaker, as the rules requires, I am going to draft those two recommendations, if the mover allows, and then they will be adopted as well. Thank you.

(Applause)

The Speaker: Thank you very much, hon. Ndahiroy. I will take hon. Pareno.

Ms Judith Pareno (Kenya): Thank you so much, Rt hon. Speaker. I rise to support this motion and specifically because of the many cases we have seen in East Africa especially here in Kenya where we have had a lot of our young women taken to the Middle East in the name of better pay, better employment only for them to turn out to be slaves; only for them to be brought back to this country in coffins after they have either fallen or trying to run away from captivity and at the end of the day it is just because they were misled that they were going for better pay.

So, Madam Speaker, this is so serious that it will need this intervention. I think this is the right time to have such intervention and to urge that we take quick steps.

The other thing, Madam Speaker is on the issue of the beggars. Of course they have already mentioned that they are misled that they come in here or are taken to Mombasa because we have a report from Mombasa showing that we have traffickers just misleading the youth and disable people who are brought in to beg and be really enslaved.

Secondly, we have a lot of our youth being brainwashed. They are told that terrorism is good and they are serving certain interests and also of our youth are reported to have been ferried for purposes of terror attacks. And this is so serious, Madam Speaker. We have just suffered so much because of terrorism because – from the report we have, they are brainwashed to the extent of becoming suicide bombers. At the end of the day, it is about our security, about our region, about peace and at the day of the day, if we could curb this trafficking in persons, then we shall be able to deal with our security as well.

Then of course there is the trafficking of the body parts; we have all read about the body parts where you find heads and tongues of people being cut off to be used for witchcraft. And this is where the albinos come in.

We have had incidences where people with special needs are being trafficked for purposes of using their body parts. This Bill will go a long way, Madam Speaker in dealing with that category of people. I think this motion could not have at a better time. I think it is a good motion and I support it. Thank you, Madam Speaker.
The Speaker: Thank you. The last one on this will be hon. Valerie. You should appreciate that we have several motions on the floor but I have seen hon. Taslma, hon. Kiangoi and hon. Mathuki. So, let us manage our time today.

Ms Valerie Nyirahabineza (Rwanda): Thank you Rt hon. Speaker. From the onset, let me thank hon. Dora Byamukama for bringing this very important motion and I fully support it.

Rt hon. Speaker, I am going to mention few issues but based on experience. When I was a Minister in Charge, we had a promotion in Rwanda which ministry was also tackling issues related to children; I was approached by six men from Norway. They came pretending to add adopt 400 children. They said that they were cooperating with some other NGOs- actually they were representing NGOs from Norway and that they wanted those children because families had been approaching them to come and adopt children from Rwanda on their behalf. They said Rwanda had many orphans due to the horrible Genocide and other disasters.

So, when they approached me, I asked them what they wanted to do with all the 400 children, they said they had been approached by more than 400 families which meant that each family was going to at least adopt one child. When I called people outside through our embassy, I got to know that even that NGO they were pretending to be representing was nonexistent. I also got to know it was something that was being followed seriously.

I also got to know through our security that those people had signed contracts with some hospitals so that whenever children or vulnerable people are transported abroad, they can be deprived of their body parts so that they could be sold to some hospitals. Let us say, when it comes to a kind of transplant, it was up to those vulnerable people to donate or be deprived of their parts. So, Madam Speaker, this is a very sad example that I wanted to give so that all of us can be conscious of the kind of problem we are facing in East Africa.

Rt hon. Speaker, again why I should thank hon. Dora Byamukama, we have a phenomenon related to street children and if my memory serves me right, I remember that in this very Assembly - I don’t remember whether it is in this very Assembly or the last one, but a hon. Member moved a motion to protect street children because if you define the term “vulnerability” the street children are also one of the categories which are under those vulnerable people. The motion was passed by the Assembly, resolutions were agreed upon but up to now no report has been tabled. Actually, I thank you, Rt hon. Speaker and my sister hon. Dora for asking the Council of Ministers to give us a kind of status report as to how even the resolutions that are passed by the Assembly have gone in terms of implementation.

So, the other point I wanted to raise here – actually while tackling this issue of trafficking in persons, we should concentrate on three aspects: the aspect of prevention; the aspect of protection and the aspect rehabilitation. I thank my sister, hon. Dora because she has clearly put the reasons why some people are subjected to trafficking- mainly poverty, greed and whatever.
This means that our Partner States should be called upon to develop measures to empower families which are suffering due to vulnerability because most likely, those persons who come from vulnerable families are the ones involved in or are victims of that kind of trafficking. But if our Partner States take serious measures to empower people so that they are not tempted by people pretending be giving them a very god life. I think that problem should be brought to an end.

About the protection, how do we protect people? Again policies exist; rights exist and we have a very big Convention on the Rights of the Person and the Convention on the Rights of the Children. I know for a fact that at least I have been involved in that exercise. People go to the UN to report on how the country has been progressing as to the implementation of those conventions. If we could also have such a feedback, it would help s to know what exactly Burundi, Kenya, Rwanda, Uganda and Tanzania are doing. We should as legislators come in as partners to see how best we can partner to solve that problem.

Then the issue of rehabilitation; hon. Zein has put it clearly, there are some people who if they have fled from such a bad phenomenon- they are put I containers and so on- we have heard so many stories around this issue. I think this is not the righty way to deal with those people. Not only have they been denied the fundamental human rights but also when they come back to their countries, or even if it is not their own country, they are not given the due attention they deserve. I think we should develop clear mechanisms.

Mr. Mathuki: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker and hon. Valerie for giving way. But also in the way of informing you that trafficking doesn’t necessarily take the external form but there is a lot of internal trafficking in most of the Partner States where children are coming from the villages coming to our Partner States cities to be exploited by some of us and in the course of that they are employed, which is also a form of trafficking. So that is an internal trafficking and that is what is actually taking place.

You may wish also to know that trafficking is the third largest lucrative business in the world after narcotics and ammunitions. And 20 percent of it involves children but there is no harmonized legislation in any our Partner States. You find most of the laws that are either amended for purposes but no specific law dealing with the trafficking. Thank you very much.

The Speaker: Thank you. Try to wind up, hon. Valerie.

Ms Nyirahabineza: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. What I wanted to say, first of all, let me thank hon. Mathuki for the information because it is very important.

The point I would like to wind up with is that the East African Community region should develop a strong partnership with security agents because this issue is really a security one. When some children leave the village to come to the city to become beggars and whatever, they
become like addicted to a kind of problem. And whenever Partner States proceed to some kind of operation together with security agencies, they can put a net around that problem.

So, I call upon all of us to work closely and urge the Council of Ministers to give us the status of the implementation of the resolutions the Assembly has taken. Thank you very much, Madam Speaker.

**The Speaker:** Thank you very much. Chair, Council, we would like to get your views on this very important issue.

**The Chairperson, Council of Ministers (Mr. Shem Bageine):** Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. I would like to thank hon. Dora Byamukama for bringing this important motion to this Assembly.

Madam Speaker, I would like to thank the hon. Members for the points raised during their contributions to this motion and I want to assure this Assembly that I have taken note of the concerns regarding the trafficking of people and particularly the vulnerable members of our communities.

Madam Speaker, there is no doubt about this scourge that has been going on and I know that in Uganda, a paper has been conceded about devising ways and means, including legislation, to ensure that this practice is stopped.

Madam Speaker, it is important that the Partner States take on this organized crime because it is indeed an organized crime and fight it. It is important that our communities are sensitized about these groups of people who come to them in various forms including what Members have mentioned, as NGOs enticing them to go to the so called areas where they will get employment – the green pastures, the attractions and so on only to end up being enslaved.

Madam Speaker, I think it is the responsibility of all of us not just the Partner States Governments but also us as leaders in our various capacities to go out and sensitize our population, bring awareness to them about the dangers they will face when they are attracted by these gangsters to go where they are now being enslaved.

Madam Speaker, I take note of the pint raised about status reporting on various resolutions including something similar to this which was passed sometime back. And I want to again assure this House that the new methods of work adopted by the Council of Ministers are going to ensure that these status reports are brought to this Assembly.

*(Applause)*

The new methods of work –I have talked about this before and at the danger of repeating myself state that each of the five Ministers is going to have responsibilities in the various sectors and we shall be meeting every quarter to review what is going on in those various sectors so that we are
better positioned to come back and report to this House. And not only reporting but to ensure that we implement the decisions and resolutions taken out by this august House.

(Applause)

Madam Speaker, I believe that in so doing, we will be able to protect our people against this organized crime. I have had of instances where people who are known to me have disappeared in the process of this trafficking and we must collectively go out and fight this crime.

Madam Speaker, once again I recognize the views presented by Members and I want to thank hon. Dora Byamukama for bringing out this important motion and I and my colleagues will support this motion. I thank you.

(Applause)

The Speaker: Thank you very much, Chair, Council. I invite hon. Dora to wind up debate.

Ms Byamukama: Madam Speaker, I would like to thank you. I am very conscious of the time and gain I would like to thank you for enabling this particular motion to find its place on the Order Paper.

I would like to all, kindly ask and crave for your indulgence that maybe I will give an annual reminder because as hon. Valerie has said, we need to track the resolutions.

I would like to thank hon. Zein for the elucidation that he gave to this House. You have given clear lenses to this topic and I would like to thank you again.

(Applause)

I would like to thank you, hon. Ngenzebuhoro who is the official seconder-and I did it on behalf of the Legal Committee- that is the confession I would like to make. So, this is not my perusal effort.

(Applause)

I want to thank hon. Ndahiro and to say from the onset that I do accept his amendments. And Madam Speaker, I will quickly read them. He says, “(iv) Call upon Partner States to institutionalize a special mechanism to protect the albinos.” And then “(v) Call upon the security organs in Partner States to collaborate and carry out operations among Partner States to free people held as slaves.”

Madam Speaker, I have no objection and I beg that the House kindly accepts and adopts these amendments.

I want to thank hon. Pareno, hon. Valerie and hon. Bageine and just to add that I have been working on the issues of human rights for more than 20 years. We do have a comprehensive law
on trafficking in persons in Uganda which I was part of the drafting team and, therefore, I believe that this could be a model law and like hon. Ngenzehuoro said, we need to work on its enforcement.

Madam Speaker, I will not go on and on. With this I would like to thank all those who did not catch the Speaker’s eye, I hope that next time she will find favor with you and I thank you gain and pray that you will support this motion wholly. I thank you.

(Applause)

The Speaker: Thank you, hon. Dora Byamukama. Hon. Members, the motion on the floor is this House do resolve to urge the EAC Council of Ministers to catalyze action to combat trafficking in persons in the East African Community.

(Question put, and agreed to.)

The Speaker: Hon. Members, allow me before we proceed to the next item to recognize in the gallery Rt hon. William Kamket, the Speaker of Baringo County Assembly. (Applause) We take pride that you are one of us out there and we shall continue to collaborate and also urge you to keep the EAC flag flying high. Thank you for coming.

(Applause)

Allow me also before we proceed to the next item to amend the Order Paper very briefly following rule 16(5) to invite the Minister of EAC of the Republic of Kenya, hon. Phyllis Kandie to make a personal statement and I take this very seriously because we have not had an opportunity to hear her voice on the microphone. So, allow me to amend the Order Paper accordingly to accommodate this very important opportunity for us all.

(Applause)

PERSONAL STATEMENT

The Cabinet Secretary, Ministry of East African Community Affairs, Commerce and Tourism (Kenya) (Ms Phyllis Kandie): Thank you, Madam Speaker for giving me this opportunity to address this honorable House and make my maiden speech. (Applause) Allow, Madam Speaker to make my personal statement very short.

Let me start by first of all welcoming all of you to Nairobi. I know that my colleagues have already done that but I wish to personally do so in this House. I also pray that you have had a comfortable stay here in Nairobi. I would have loved to be together with you over the past few days since you came in but because of very heavy national duties, I was not able to be with you.

Madam Speaker, I also wish, at the earliest opportunity, to apologize to this august House for my absence from the Assembly on a number of sessions. (Applause) This in itself has been
occasioned again by national duty and the nature of my portfolio, which in the last couple of months has demanded my presence in a number of international and regional forums.

Unlike some of my colleagues in the Council, I don’t enjoy a deputy or an Assistant Cabinet Secretary to fill the void. Nevertheless, it is still my cardinal duty and responsibility to be in this Assembly. (Applause)

Madam Speaker, as a Member of this august House, I would like to play my duty assigned to me and I would like to assure this House of my total commitment to the business of the Assembly. (Applause)

Madam Speaker, I wish to thank the Speaker of the National Assembly of Kenya, hon. Justin Muturi for his continued support to EALA and for allowing us to use this facility despite the constraints and the challenges.

Finally, I would like to assure the hon. Members of my commitment and the commitment of the Government of Kenya to support EALA and wish that we will continue with fruitful deliberations in the remaining sessions and future sessions of this honorable Assembly. I thank you. (Applause)

The Speaker: Hon. Members, as you are aware, a personal statement is not debated. So, I just want to acknowledge and appreciate that personal statement from the hon. Minister of EAC of the Republic of Kenya.

MOTION

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION OF THE ASSEMBLY URGING THE EAC COUNCIL OF MINISTERS ON STRATEGIES FOR SLUM UPGRADE AND PREVENTION IN THE EAC REGION

Ms Nancy Abisai (Kenya): Thank you, Rt hon. Speaker for giving me this opportunity to move this motion. Madam Speaker and hon. Members, I beg to move a motion for a resolution of the Assembly urging the EAC Council of Ministers on strategies for slum upgrading and prevention in the East African Community region. I beg to move.


Ms Abisai: Thank you, Madam Speaker.

“AWARE THAT in order to promote the achievements of the objectives of the Community as set out in Article 5 of the Treaty for the establishment of the EAC Partner States as per Article 120 undertakes to closely cooperate amongst themselves in the field of social welfare with respect to;
(a) employment;

(b) poverty alleviation programs and working conditions; and

(c) The development and adoption of a common approach towards the disadvantaged and marginalized groups including children, the youth, the elderly and persons with disabilities through rehabilitation and probation of among others foster homes, health care and training;

CONCERNED TO DATE well over 50 percent of the world’s population already lives in cities. The vast majority of these people live on less than a dollar a day - hungry. One third of them live in slums without access to safe drinking water, sanitation and are overcrowded in shacks made up of temporary building materials that cannot with stand the slightest challenge from nature; have no tenure of land and so risk eviction of authorities often without notice. Most dwellers are under the age of 25 and have no serious prospects of meaningful employment;

NOTING THAT the combination of the above factors makes the urban poor the most disempowered groups in terms of poverty and access to health and education and the most vulnerable group in terms of HIV and Aids and other diseases;

FURTHER CONCERNED THAT their numbers are growing every day and thus represent our collective failure to come to terms with the rapid urbanization and the consequences of globalization.

FURTHER CONCERNED THAT attaining the Millennium Development Goals will depend increasingly on the ability of Governments and their local authorities and serious society partners to come up with concrete solutions to make our cities and towns more equitable and inclusive;

ACKNOWLEDGING THAT most easily perceived expression of 20th Century social change in East Africa has been the creation and rapid growth of towns and high rate of rural urban migration;

REALIZING THAT the high rate of urbanization, increasing poverty and escalation of housing costs and prices have made the provision of housing a challenge to the ordinary citizens within the East African region;

FURTHER REALIZING THAT the high level of poverty in the East African region has made access to decent housing an elusive dream to the swelling ranks of people living below the poverty line and that the problem in urban areas is mainly acute shortage in the number of habitable dwellings, inadequate infrastructure, community facilities and services thus leading to increase in squatter and overcrowded settlements;
ALSO AWARE THAT poor access to affordable and adequate housing constrains economic and social development of slum dwellers and contributes to poverty and deplorable human conditions in such areas as in the EAC region;

CONSCIOUS THAT nearly all future population growth in the EAC region will be in cities and towns, which are growing at an unprecedented rate, soon the rural population will be less than the urban while the number of urban dwellers living in poverty will inevitably increase;

NOTING THAT in spite of the efforts by Governments, housing demands far outstrip supply in the EAC region;

FURTHER NOTING the need for adequate, suitable and equitable housing has remained a major priority of every Government in the EAC region;

ALSO NOTING THAT housing is a basic necessity of life and yet the majority of the population live in poor housing facilities with no adequate sanitary facilities or water and this lack of adequate housing has lowered the life expectancy of the homeless and exposed them to serious health risks and gravely affected their contribution to society;

COGNIZANT THAT the right to adequate housing is firmly recognized under the international Human Rights law under the Universal Declaration of Human Rights which sets out the standard of adequate housing that provides for: accessibility, affordability, availability, cultural adequacy, habitability, legal security of tenure and location;

CONVINCED THAT adequate housing is one of the effective means to alleviate poverty because shelter is usually the most expensive item on household;

APPRECIATING THAT the eradication of urban poverty and the realization of the Habitat Agenda Goal of Shelter for All to which all EAC Partner States are signatories can only be realized if we recognize the right to the city for the urban poor;

CONCERNED THAT slums are by definition informal settlements and such are considered illegal and, therefore, do not benefit from the basic infrastructure and public services;

CONVINCED THAT developing and supply of subsidized housing and quality accommodation should be a priority for poverty reduction after access to employment and social integration because lack of adequate housing has led to mushrooming of slums and these have caused marginalization, deprivation, unemployment and underemployment;

NOW, THEREFORE, this Assembly do resolve as follows:

(i) To urge the Council of Ministers to expedite the development of the EAC Housing Policy for the social economic upliftment of the socially marginalized section of the population with the active involvement of all key stakeholders including the community;
To urge the Council of Ministers to introduce a legal framework or a Bill on EAC slum upgrading to be enacted by EALA to ensure the attainment of the right to adequate housing for East African citizenry. Madam Speaker, I beg to move. (Applause)

The Speaker: Thank you very much, hon. Nancy Abisai. Hon. Members, this is a very important motion and I invite hon. Abisai to justify her motion.

Ms Abisai: Madam Speaker, people have always misunderstood the concept of slum upgrading and slum prevention. One would ask, why upgrade slums? But we are not talking about upgrading slums just like a slum. We need to understand, first of all, what is the right to live in dignity in terms of adequate housing.

That is why, Madam Speaker I can confidently confirm to this House that, yes, indeed all the five Partner States have moved towards trying to develop documents and policies that can ensure decent housing for their citizens. However, it is not in harmony in terms of the implementation and in terms of how this then should be achieved.

Tanzania has an urban policy development; Uganda has a framework and a strategy for improvement of slums; Kenya has a housing policy and a housing Bill; Burundi has a strategy but not in terms of a legal binding document; and Rwanda has done tremendously well in terms of trying to come up with strategies of slum upgrading.

However, there is need for us to understand that the whole question of housing in terms of slums and the definition. Slums, Madam Speaker, are a result of failed policies and lack of sound urban planning. That is one.

Madam Speaker, the Universal Declaration on Human Rights has defined housing and states that: "Everyone has the right to a standard living adequate for health, and wellbeing of himself or herself and their family including food, clothing, housing, medical care and necessary social services."

Further, general comment No. 4 on the same also talks about seven issues but because of time, I am just going to highlight a few but my motion has been detailed. I would want to talk about the legal security of tenure.

Madam Speaker, many members within the EAC region do not have legal security of tenure. We come from countries and backgrounds where we believe that we should all own land, which is not possible.

Security of tenure means that you have access to leases, you can rent and own but there is no legal security of tenure for people living in slums.

Madam Speaker, on this I would like to just take Member to an incidence that happened here in Kenya where a majority of residents had built in Nairobi in a place called Mukuru kwa
Njenga in Nairobi’s South B area. They had occupied an area which actually belongs to Nairobi Pipeline. And one time there was a bad fire that killed almost 1,000 people from the slums. That was because they lived along railway lines and power lines, which is actually very dangerous.

Two, there is also availability of services. Most of these slum dwellers lack sanitary facilities; they lack water and even lack food and clothing. Maybe that one would say is not an issue of the government but I want to say this, availability of basic services and needs is a fundamental right for every citizen of the EAC. If you can’t avail services in times of how you want your citizens to live, then the situation that you are living in is really deplorable; it is not dignified; and it is in a bad situation.

Three, Madam Speaker, is affordability. You will all agree with me – and I just want to start with you, hon. Members of Parliament, I think any time that Members of Parliament get to their positions, most of those who probably don’t have homes think of having a home. Why do you think about that? That is why one of the facilities is a mortgage. Why is it important for even Members then who can be able to afford a dignified life?

That means the people living in slums also need to live a dignified life. And how can they be able to live a dignified life if they don’t have housing financing systems that can support poor people to be able to afford houses? Housing markets within the region are very expensive and that makes people live in squalid conditions.

When you are driving from Jomo Kenyatta International Airport, if you pass Mombasa Road and then come straight to the city, Nairobi is an interesting city because you can choose to live and see only what you want to see. You can come from the airport, drive up to the city, go to the rich suburbs of Nairobi, go to the nice up market areas of shopping.

But then you also need to see the other side of Nairobi where as a city, you find that if you drive through other roads, three quarters of the land is occupied by slums. And the population statistics of Nairobi are so bad and sometimes unbelievable.

90 percent of the population in Nairobi lives on 5 percent of the land. That is according to our National Housing Policy and the statistics that are very clear. Now, if you have 90 percent of the urban population within the city living on 5 percent of the land, what are you saying about the living conditions? What are we talking about the living conditions then? Apartheid - I don’t know.

Secondly, we are talking about habitability, is it habitable? Some of them live in places where there are swamps, it is not even a place you can put up a structure. These are the things that we are talking about when we say let us build an East Africa where we talk about right to live in security; in peace; and in dignity.
We also have accessibility; is the housing accessible? The housing market – everybody is going into housing within the region. But what is happening to the poorest who are the majority? The other day when we had a thanks giving ceremony for the Governor of Nairobi, one of the things he talked about was that out of every 10 people in Nairobi City, eight live in informal settlements. What does that mean and yet this is supposed to be the capital city of the country?

I said that if it is happening in Nairobi, I know in Dar es Salaam we have slums, and a big portion of slums. We have slums in Uganda. We have slums in Burundi.

I would like to thank the Republic of Rwanda; they took us to a very good example of how they are trying to implement slum upgrading. I know that we could also be able to identify with what they are doing as a Republic and harmonize our policies so that we can be able to have good housing for our people.

Lastly, Madam Speaker, it is a whole question of location and cultural adequacy even for the housing because for us as Africans, it is a sad situation hon. Members that in a 10 by 10 roomed house you have a family of about 10 people living in the same house. What happens to that mum, dad and children- you know what I am talking about without having to go into many issues? It is a very embarrassing situation and the kind of situation that portends. We should make sure that we get rid of this situation of slums within our cities so that even as we say we want to encourage trade; we want to encourage tourism; and we want to encourage investment, we make sure that we don’t have so many people living in squalid conditions and all they will think is to steal, kill because they have to get their means for the day.

We must get rid of that and know that we cannot have sustainable development unless we have sustainable urbanization. Madam Speaker, that is what and why I feel that we must have strategies for slum upgrading within the region. I thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you very much, hon. Nancy Abisai. Hon. Members the motion on the floor is that this Assembly do resolve to urge the EAC Council of Ministers on strategies for slum upgrading and prevention in the East African Community region. Debate is open.

Mr. Adam Kimbisa (Tanzania): Thank you, Madam Speaker for giving me the floor. First of all, I commend the mover of the motion and, therefore, I rise to support for the following reasons: one, I had the opportunity to visit two slum concentration areas; one here in Kibera and the biggest of all in Mumbai.

Two, I worked with slum dwellers and slum lords because there are slum dwellers and slum lords as well. And in Tanzania also as a mayor, I worked on a concept called slum upgrading and unfortunately I couldn’t finish it because it is a big task to do.
Madam Speaker, maybe let us discuss why people move in the first place. Why are slum dwellers produced? One of the reasons is exactly what we discussed last week about land grabbing. A lot of people’s land upcountry – in the rural areas- has been grabbed and have been turned landless. The only option, which they think is maybe fair to them is to go to the cities.

The other reason is climate change. In certain areas of the country you find that there is drought; in others floods. People, for example two to three years ago in Tanzania, we saw in areas where they were raising cattle, most of the cattle died, people lost all their wealth and, therefore, moved to the cities after losing everything.

Others just want to go and have good life - electricity, discos, name it.

And others call themselves economic refugees. They just want to move and become refugees in cities. All of them put together, they go there for green pastures; meaning jobs, water, electricity, schools, health facilities and housing. To their specifications, these are green pastures, which they are missing in the rural areas and they will get them in the cities.

Now, the million dollar question is, do they get any of these? Do they get what they are dreaming about? The issue is, no they don’t get these activities; they can’t get these jobs; they can’t get these facilities, why? Mind you, these people who come to the cities are not educated in the first place and, therefore, they have no skills at all. They are not employable, so to speak.

But also, our Governments in the whole of Africa- haven’t created enough jobs to absorb these people who are coming from upcountry. We can’t. The biggest employer is the public sector. Now, we can’t employ all of them. Therefore, the issue here, no matter how much noise you will create for them to get housing loans, they can’t pay them because they are not employed. How are they going to get the loans? Even if you create beautiful laws on earth, they have no jobs.

Even if you give a 1 percent interest rate for housing, the banks can’t give them loans because they have no jobs and they are not employable. Therefore, as I said, they can’t get electricity and other facilities.

Madam Speaker, these people keep on coming year in year out. One big example, a few years ago in Dar es Salaam, people who were living in unplanned and un-serviced dwellings- not necessarily slums- 75 percent of the people of Dar es Salaam were living in unplanned and un-serviced dwellings. And it is increasing because the city fathers – I don’t know why they don’t call them city ladies or whatever- the city fathers can’t cope with the influx of the people coming to the cities and, therefore, we don’t have enough plots to allocate to these people.
But even we assume that we had enough plots, could they build those houses? But one of the biggest impediments was that we were unable to plan and give services of water, electricity and plots. So, when somebody comes in and asks for a plot, you show him a plot and so it is increasingly that 80 percent of the people of Dar es Salaam are living in unplanned and unserviced dwellings.

You may find in an unplanned area a one million dollar house but at the same time there is a one thousand shillings house as well. And the road to reach there is unimaginable. How they go and get there nobody really knows. So, there are lots of unplanned and unserviced areas.

Now, what is the way out? I think come back to the same topic we discussed the other day. Encourage and develop survival mechanisms within the rural areas because these people—after all—are coming from the rural areas to the cities. If we can improvise wherever they are and whenever they are, give them enough, for example, enough land and, therefore, that land can be used for tilling and of course value addition, or rather enough market for their produce. They will stay there.

Or start small and medium enterprises at the regional, district and even at ward level so that people can be kept busy. Even if they come to the city, they will find life so tough and would rather go back rather staying there.

Another thing, which I thought may be easy is rural electrification because it also not only helps people to have their own discos and good life there but also try to create some small enterprises wherever they are. Because electricity is there, they can have fridges, charge their telephones, watch TV, et cetera and, therefore, life will be available wherever they are. This can help to minimize their coming to the cities. Otherwise, I support the motion. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

**The Speaker:** I will take hon. Mumbi, hon. Sarah Bonayo and hon. Kessy in that order.

**Ms Agnes Ng’aru Mumbi (Kenya):** Thank you, Madam Speaker. I would like to congratulate my sister, hon. Nancy for this motion. Like the previous speaker, I come from that background of local government.

I want to speak about the challenges - I am happy because the mover of the motion is an East African from Kenya, resident in Nairobi and, therefore, she is equally aware of what I am going to say that the slum upgrading business, even here in Nairobi, is big business, which is being orchestrated by the very people who are supposed to be supporting it.

It is another business - the roads themselves, and the people who are living in the suburbs around face a different life from those living in other cities in the world. You find that the cream of society has their own area and there are some areas that are more prone to floods.
What is shocking are the statistics from CAMCON firm show that there are owners of slums in Kibera, Kileleshwa and the like here in Nairobi and, therefore, upgrading of slums and the like becomes a major challenge even for the slum fathers and mothers for that matter who would attempt to upgrade to be a successful program.

Likewise I think that the solution in Kenya would be in devolution where the influx of young people seeking employment in towns is contained in the County Government – the headquarters of the devolution centers that are going to be upgraded so that activities of the youth and people seeking employment are contained.

But the reason I support this motion is not even because of the upgrading or planning of the slums because we are already we are in a crisis. I support it because this is the time to address the more than 50 percent of people living in the cities and major towns that are living in slums. And my hope is that as we debate and pass this resolution, it is not going to the shelves of the Council of Ministers. Something is going to be done urgently so that by the time we achieve – in Kenya we call it Vision 2030- I know we are at different stages in the East African Partner States - we are able to move together and contain the growth and expansion of plans.

Some of the people in the slums are actually living there because it is a source of business for them. There is a lot of informal trade and there is a lot of wealth even as they refuse to develop the survey plans, there are some who are there because of economic activities. So, there are challenges and we have to appreciate that as leaders. But that doesn’t mean that the country’s ministers can sit back and wish for those many visions that we have - 2020, 2030 and now there is a 2065.

The mover of the motion also knows that planning is done and the government wants to move. Remember what happened to Buruburu Estate in the 70s, Umoja Estates, the Dandora in the 80, so it is not that it cannot be done but we also have to deal with the issues of what happened that made them not move. I am sure the Council of Ministers is listening to us with good will on behalf of our people who live in the slums. I beg to support. Thank you. (Applause)

**The Speaker:** Thank you very much. I will take hon. Kessy.

**Dr. Kessy Nderakindo (Tanzania):** Thank you, Rt hon. Speaker. I rise to support the motion for one particular reason that we call ourselves “One people one destiny,” and hence how can we allow a human being to be born in the slums? We are the products our childhood. The children who are born I the slums grow with that environment in their minds. And, therefore, we question ourselves in this integration, how can we say that we are one people while others are raised in good environments and others are born and raised in the slums? We cannot be one people if we are going to be born in such environment.
We are talking about the children; it is the children who are being raised in the slums that are going to be our medical; doctors to treat us when we are old. It is the children who are born in the slums who are going to be our drivers.

How are they going to be educated unless there are schools in the slums? It is very different to have a school in the slums; to go to a school in the slum is very different from going to an international school where they have everything. How can we allow this?

We do not have integration unless we have equality in particular in creating environments that will make us all feel like equal human beings.

Having slums have a deep psychological effect on those who are growing in the slums. They feel different; they feel second class citizens. How can we call ourselves one people when others feel they are second class citizens in this East African region?

What about those who live in good environments? They will be forced to discriminate against those who live in the slums in view that they are second class citizens. We force ourselves to discriminate amongst ourselves by having different environments for the same people we call humans of this region. Therefore, Madam Speaker I think that in order to get to the same destiny, we absolutely have to prevent and upgrade the slums. I support the motion. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

(Applause)

The Speaker: Thank you. I will take hon. Sarah Bonaya. I just ask that when you catch the Speaker’s eye, try to be brief so that we are able to give as many people as possible an opportunity.

Ms Sarah Bonaya (Kenya): Thank you, Madam Speaker for this opportunity. I would like to start by welcoming everybody because this is my first time to speak in this House. I welcome everybody to Nairobi and I hope you will enjoy the stay.

(Applause)

Madam Speaker, I would also like to thank the mover of this motion. This is a very critical area of our concern as leaders and it is important that we deliberate on such a major issue that affects our region.

First and foremost, I would like to say that we have varied reasons for rural urban migration and I think it is critical that we look at it and find out why it really occurs. It has already been said by other speakers that there is lack of incentives in the rural areas such as lack of accessibility, lack of health care, lack of security, lack of farming incentives and market for the produce in the rural areas. So somehow people find themselves migrating to the cities in search of better opportunities.
There are also historical reasons like the major slums in Nairobi. Kibera and Karioko are places where the former soldiers who fought in Burma were relocated without proper compensation. So, they were just left to rot there in poverty and that is why we are still seeing the remnants and others who joined the military.

So, the main thing is marginalization and deprivation of the population both in the rural and urban due to unemployment and underemployment.

Even those who came to be employed are actually the same because the basic minimum wage is too low for them to be able to acquire anything for themselves. With the just developed system in Kenya I see some hope because their resources are managed at the local level to be able to utilize the locals, especially the mineral and natural resources for the benefit of the local population.

Unfortunately in Kenya, there is a rallying call where in order to attract direct foreign investment, you are supposed to give free land. What we don’t realize is that the only commodity that is permanent but we have not yet equated it to any value is land. Land is the only heritage we have; it is the only source of our livelihood because most of the rural population depends on this land.

Once we displace them and give this land away to the so called investors, who are bringing us good development, which I don’t object to, but this land should be valued and the population where the development takes place should not be seen walking bare footed and smeared with dust from the mines with no shelter or any benefits to show for the wealth that is being extracted from their neighborhood and their own environment which they have protected over the years.

So, I think as Africans we are living in a historical moment. We the educated leaders, as we call ourselves, have taken the comfort zone and we have ensured that we are all very comfortable without looking at the population that is withering under our leadership. It is high time that we looked at the value of our land and the population that has protected it over the years and give these people the benefit. African is where the whole world is rushing for their development and this is an opportunity for us to face our partners squarely and tell them to invest in our resource. We have a big resource in the form of land; we also have a big resource called minerals; we also have a big resource in form of wild animals and forests, which we can use to enrich our population. Thank you, Madam Speaker. I support the motion.

(Applause)

The Speaker: Thank you. I will take hon. Patricia.
Ms Patricia Hajabakiga (Rwanda): Thank you, Madam Speaker. Let me thank my sister, hon. Nancy for bringing this important motion and this comes after we had just created a chapter for the global parliamentarians for the habitat agenda. This shows how much importance this Assembly gives to the issue of housing and specifically urban development.

If I may recall, Rt hon. Speaker, I think in the Second Assembly, hon. Frederic did move a similar motion in nature for housing in our countries. I don’t know how much we have so far done because we don’t receive any reports as to how the motions we have passed are being implemented by our Partner States.

That said, I will probably differ with many who want to keep the people in rural areas because that is not possible any longer.

(Applause)

Madam Speaker, if you have seen the trend right from 1970 when the first habitat issues were raised in the world, the number of the urban dwellers was fewer but as time goes, they are increasing and they are increasing for the very reasons hon. Kimbisa raised.

The issue of conditions in our rural areas, inequality between the urban and the rural, so people think that if I move out of the rural area, and go to the urban area, I will get better life.

If I recall also the previous motion on trafficking in persons, the majority of the people who are trafficked are those living in exactly those slum areas and neither from the rural areas nor the rich areas. That is where they go for them.

Rt hon. Speaker, if you look at the Millennium Goals; 1 and 2 can never be achieved unless we achieve Goal 7, which encompasses the issues of environment and habitat. We may talk about poverty alleviation but without linking it to these two aspects, it will never be achieved unless we link it to housing and particularly urban housing and urban development.

One of the stumbling blocks hon. Kimbisa raised is the issue of planning, which we have failed to actually do in the EAC and probably the whole of Africa. The aspect of planning- and I think that is what in the previous motions we have always raised that we need to put more money in the planning of our urban areas. That is missing. It is unfortunate that I didn’t know earlier that this motion was coming. I would have come up with the national budgets for each of our countries as to how much they put in this sector every year. It is peanuts and there is no way we can move ahead without putting money in the very important sector of planning and particularly urban planning.

So, one issue is planning but the other is the level of quality of houses themselves. I didn’t know that it is not easy for the governments to actually construct housing for each and every citizen. But at least if we did the planning and categorized our citizens, we could know which
ones need support and those who can manage if they are supported by the government to pay little by little until they get their adequate housing.

Rt hon. Speaker, hon. Nancy said that Rwanda is doing very well. I don’t think so. I have been in the lands and housing and environment sector at least for the past I don’t know how many years - from Tanzania through to Rwanda - that has always been my life. But as much as Rwanda has tried to eradicate what we call grass thatched houses in the rural areas, we still have a lot of challenges in the urban areas.

If you come to Kigali and see the top hills, they are all habited by very poor people and yet if you compare Kigali and Geneva – if you look at the hills- in Geneva the people who live on the hill tops are the very rich people because they can afford the infrastructure and proper protection of the soils to reduce the soil erosion. But for us it is the poor ones who live up or who have gone down in the wetlands. Fine, there are policies; Rwanda is trying but we have not reached where we want to reach. And I think as earlier said by hon. Nancy; we need to request our Council of Ministers to bring this as an agenda for the EAC other than just leaving it to each country to fight on its own. Let us see how we can harmonize because the more people we have in the urban areas without control and proper management the more it will affect all of us because of the Protocols we have which we are implementing like the Common Market.

Any insecurity in one country is insecurity in another. So we cannot afford not to harmonize these approaches as to how we deal with the issue of urban development and particularly the poor people living in the slums. Thank you very much, Rt hon. Speaker. I support the motion.

The Speaker: Thank you. I will take hon. Sebalu.

Mr. Mike Sebalu (Uganda): Thank you very much, Madam Speaker for this opportunity. Allow me also not o debate but thank hon. Kandie for the statement of personal explanation. I think it was good and timely and I want to accept her invitation for dinner tonight. I am available.

I would also like to thank hon. Nancy for this very important motion. It is timely; it is relevant; it is necessary; and it needs all the support of the progressive East Africans. I don’t have any doubt that all of us in this Assembly belong to the progressive group of East Africans.

Madam Speaker, I just want to concentrate on one aspect. But before I go to that aspect, I want to associate myself with the arguments of hon. Kimbisa having been a practitioner in that area and a major stakeholder as a Mayor of Dar es Salaam City. He raised a number of issues, which we really need to be multi-sectoral because the problem is equally multi-sectoral in nature.
We have to look at issues of poverty alleviation – definitely even if you upgraded these slums without empowering the people in terms of earnings, you will give them money or facilities to secure housing but they will sell it on the same day and go to do other things. So, it is bigger than just giving them the housing. And I want to appreciate that poverty alleviation is one such.

But we also have urban planning. We have our cities which are planned without being zoned. When you go to the West and most of these developed cities, you find that the cities are zoned. There are areas where you cannot build anything less than five stories. There are areas which are demarcated residential and central business districts. But in some of our places, you find offices invading areas that are predominantly supposed to be residential and then you find residential areas going right in the center of the central business district. So, we need to do something about that in terms of planning and zoning.

But this also goes to the whole question of land use from a bigger perspective, which is also critical in terms of ensuring that we put up cites that are well planned.

My main point, Madam Speaker, which I want to raise is to do with the way, as politicians, we are managing issues of urban development, even the nature of managing our cities. I appreciate democratization but to a certain level, it can be counter to development. You find that some of the city leaders are elected leaders and when it comes to matters of streamlining urban development, the whole question of the voters will come in. “Don’t remove them; those are our voters; they gave us votes; elections are nearing.” This is one of the major problems that we are having.

You find people have settled in a manner that would not be acceptable but because they are voters and the elections are around the corner, you find that politicians have also made a big contribution in compromising standards of our settlements especially in cities. And it is common knowledge that the cities have the biggest number of voters. That is real because they definitely go to the ballot. So, this has created a problem.

Those of you that are following the politics in Kampala City, there are issues to do with getting that city on track but the Mayor with the support if his voters – the Executive Director is trying to streamline – things have gone to court but you find that at the end of the day politics surrounding that crisis is a big problem. So, as politicians at the regional level, and our counterparts at national level, we need to shape up in this area. Maybe a regional initiative may be of necessity to ensure that issues of urban planning and development are mainstreamed and depoliticized to ensure that we do the right things. That is the only way we can upgrade.

Upgrading slums can be politically costly but we must be ready to take on that political cost for the benefit of the bigger picture of ensuring that our people live in worthy environments. Thank you, Madam Speaker.
**The Speaker:** I will take hon. Kiangoi, hon. Nakawuki and hon. Bazivamo in that order. I have seen hon. Zein, hon. Ogle and hon. Mbidde but unfortunately we want to be able to manage our time better this evening.

**Mr Joseph Kiangoi Ombasa (Kenya):** I thank you, Madam Speaker for giving me this opportunity. In fact you had noted that I had stood for the last two days and it is good that I am now there.

**The Speaker:** Take heart.

**Mr. Ombasa:** I have taken heart. Madam Speaker, I would like to begin from the point as to why I think there is rural urban migration and I would like to say that in order for us to address that issue we must begin by growing our economies. If we don’t grow our economies to accommodate our populations then we are getting nowhere with the solutions that we are attempting to give. That is why it is important, Madam Speaker that the East African integration becomes a reality so that our economies are able to cater for all our people in the region.

Madam Speaker, the second thing that I want to say is that distribution of wealth is a problem for our African States and that is why you find a lot of inequalities. There should be deliberate policies to distribute wealth so that we cater for the people who have no income at all.

For example, if you look at the minimum wage that exists on the average in the EAC Partner States, it is miserable. One cannot live on that minimum wage for a month. So, how could we expect these people to stay in decent places particularly so, when these people offer unskilled labor, the economies are slow in growth and we cannot get them places to work so as to earn a decent living?

Madam Speaker, the other issue that I would like to raise is that of planning in agreement with what others have already said. I see so many places set up by Government for industries, high cost houses, middle cost houses but I have never seen a Government that sets up enough spaces for low income earners in this area. So, we are taking up all available land to cater for the people who can be able to buy that land.

The cost of land, for example, here in Nairobi if you go to places like Lovington and Kileleshwa is Kshs 300 million per acre. So, very few people can afford that. The others being opened up in the serene areas like Kitengela and towards Machakos, it is Kshs 80 million per acre. But where are the areas that are being left for the poor people to stay in? So, that planning is very important. We should include it in our planning and then we shall be able to move ahead.
The other issue is education of slum dwellers. I agree with hon. Sebalu and the hon. Mumbi hinted on it that slum dwellers are there also for business. Of course the landlords are there taking the junk of the income from them. But the slum dwellers also – in Kibera they were given some decent houses. They actually leased them out and went back to stay in the slums because they love staying there. So, we must educate them that they should be able to move from there because there are better facilities for them.

The final point on which I would again want to agree with hon. Sebalu is that of the attitude of our politicians. We are the creators of slums because we urge people to come to towns in order to cote for us. And every time a slum is about to be demolished, the politicians will make the loudest noise. He will go to the slum dwellers and prevent the Police from destroying the slums and yet the land tenure system affecting those slums is not that the land belongs to the slum dwellers. Instead of asking that the slum dwellers be taken elsewhere, they want them there so that they don’t move to another constituency to vote for another person. Madam Speaker, with those few remarks, I support the motion.

Ms Susan Nakawuki (Uganda): Thank you, Madam Speaker for this opportunity especially as a neighbor of the mover of the motion and also as one of the seconders of the motion. I would like to thank the mover of the motion for the job well done.

Madam Speaker, allow me also add my voice to emphasize the need for all the Partner States to adhere to all international covenants and conventions which recognize housing rights and the corresponding obligations there under, especially the obligations enshrined under Article 2 of the International Convention on Economic Social and Cultural Rights.

Madam Speaker, allow me also to appreciate all those noble East Africans and Africans as a whole who have fought so hard to ensure that the issue of housing is top on the agenda of the UN because you are all aware that much as our Constitutions recognize the right to shelter, but it has not been given the attention that it deserves. So, I would like to appreciate those ones.

Madam Speaker, I would also like to concur with my colleagues like hon. Adam Kimbisa and hon. Kiangoi that as we talk about slums upgrading, we should also look at the causes. We should ask ourselves, why are these people opting to be slum dwellers? Why are our people moving from the villages to come to the cities and stay in these slums?

Among those ones, Madam Speaker, the most evident is rural urban migration. As you are aware, for example, if I am to talk about Uganda, we have had so many youth having access to land but they have opted to selling it in order to come to the city. Usually they sell the land and buy a boda boda – a small motorcycle – and come to the city to do business. So, that way the, the only resort to cheap housing is the slum. So, until Governments come up to make these rural areas attractive, there is no way we are going to keep our people in the rural areas.
Madam Speaker, we can all recognise the fact that there are some villages which don’t even have a primary school. They don’t have health facilities; they have to travel miles and miles to go to neighboring villages where they can get these services. That alone demoralizes them and they cannot afford to keep in the villages. Yet we know very well that our economies thrive on agriculture. So, if the youth who are energetic to do the agriculture are moving to the cities and opting to stay in slums then the situation is alarming.

Madam Speaker, the mover of the motion has also talked about the issue of affordability of housing. She has talked about subsidized housing. I would like to appreciate the Government of the Republic of Kenya. They have done a good job via slum upgrading, for example, in Kibera slums. But at the same time, as my colleagues have talked about educating these slum dwellers, there is still a problem because even those ones who have been beneficiaries of the Kibera Slum upgrading, you realize that those ones who are given those cheap houses have in turn rented them out to other people who can afford and they have gone back to live in the slums.

In fact that draws me to a recommendation to all our Partner States, especially Kenya to carry out this continuous monitoring and evaluation of the housing conditions. Because unless they go to check whether those people they put in those subsidized houses are staying there, people will continue getting these houses and either continue renting them out or selling them off, thereby not helping to solve the problem.

Secondly, about these subsidized houses, as you can realize, most of our Partner States have left the issue of housing to the private sector. The private sector invests their money in the houses and that way they will do anything possible to make sure that they get back their money. There is no one who is going to provide cheap housing if they are private investors. So, that way, I would call upon our Partner States Governments to create incentives to kind of subsidize for these private investors. That way they will also be able to provide cheap housing. Otherwise it will be next to impossible.

As I come to my conclusion, Madam Speaker, finally, there is also a problem of forced evictions. As we know, evictions are being done by both Governments, local government, private individuals, especially those in the armed forces – those have been very common cases whereby security personnel come and settle on your land. When you go to ask questions, they pull out guns and many people have been with no option but to try somewhere else. So, I feel Government should come up and protect these people.

If Government is to evict people on its land or in forest reserves, they must be able to resettle these people. They must be able to provide alternatives. Otherwise if there are no alternatives then all these people are going to end up in slums and we won’t be solving a problem.
Finally, allow me to add a resolution on top of what has been provided by the mover. It is for all EAC Partner States Governments to provide support services for the homeless and other vulnerable groups. We know very well that for those developed countries - ok we are also developing countries and so, we are going there – where people are homeless, they have been able to provide shelter for people to go.

For example, in Uganda where there are those street children who had come from the Northern part of the country, those people come to Kampala definitely while being brought by somebody to do street begging, and then Government collects those children and takes them back to their original areas. But within a day, they board a bus and return. Those people who bring them back can only house them in a slum.

**The Speaker:** Hon. Nakawuki, I think you will draft your additional resolution and pass it on to the mover to see whether she accepts.

**Ms Nakawuki:** Thank you very much, Rt hon. Speaker. I support the motion. I will take hon. Bazivamo and hon. Leonce will be the last on this one and I will invite Chair, Council if you have a comment and then hon. Nancy will wind up. I appreciate there are other Member who would have wished to debate but we don’t have a lot of time.

**Mr. Christophe Bazivamo (Rwanda):** Thank you, Rt hon. Speaker. I rise for a few things because most of what I wanted to say has been said. One, I thank the move for this important motion.

Second, is to emphasize the issue of planning because it is very important and lack of planning is more costly than investing in planning. I am sure that we all agree that we have cities where the rich and poor stay but it is important to plan for both categories of people to avoid upgrading slums while other areas are developing.

I would like to propose an additional resolution, if the mover agrees, as follows: “This Assembly do resolve to urge Partner States to expedite the elaboration, adoption and implementation of the cities Master Plans, catering for different categories of housing to accommodate different categories of our cities’ population.” Thank you, Madam Speaker.

**The Speaker:** Thank you, hon. Bazivamo. Pass that additional resolution to the mover. I will take hon. Leonce Ndarubagiye.

**Mr. Leonce Ndarubagiye (Burundi):** Thank you very much, Rt hon. Speaker for pronouncing my name correctly, among other things. *(Laughter)*

There is a saying that water is life; sanitation is dignity. Definitely, every human being aspires to have good life and dignity. I congratulate the mover of this motion and I rise to support it.
When you look at our situation in the area, especially in the infrastructure sector, you find that we, Africans have failed in the area of organization. I can give several examples, what is this traffic jam that can keep someone in one place for hours in a town? What is this mushrooming of slums in the city suburbs?

In European developed countries, they have found a solution through planning and subsidization. They subsidize houses for the less privileged exactly like they do for agriculture until we reach there with the slums. I beg to support. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The Speaker: Thank you very much. Allow me to invite Chair, Council and I will appreciate that by your background, this is a very important area for you.

The Chairperson, Council of Ministers (Mr. Shem Bageine): Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. I want to thank hon. Nancy for bringing up this motion, which touches on the lives of many of our people that are subjected to living in conditions that are not worth talking about.

Madam Speaker, the issue of upgrading slums is not a simple issue. It is, as one of the Members, spoke earlier on a multi-sectoral issue, which involves among others the land tenure systems, which are different in our various Partner States. There are countries where what we call the allodial title belongs to Government- the State - and in others, it belongs to the people. And this has an effect on the urban development or any other development including agriculture. I don’t know whether it is possible for the Partner States to harmonize the land tenure systems because in some instances, it may call for a revolution.

Madam Speaker, the other aspect is what we talked about the other day, land use including zoning of various areas both in the urban and rural areas; the town and country planning processes.

The economic policies under which we operate - in our Treaty we state that our economies are private sector driven. And if that is going to be the drivers of the economies, those go along with the principle of profit making by the economic drivers.

Madam Speaker, we can sit here, debate and come up with beautiful ideas but we must also remember that our Governments, to who this resolution is addressed, have very limited resources to be able to develop housing for these poor people.

The limited resource envelopes that we have are faced with ever increasing demands in the fields of infrastructure that is vital for our development, education, health, security et cetera. We are not, therefore, at a level where we can meaningfully engage, at this point in time, in provision of housing. Yes, we can have policies designed to help in this direction but I must caution that it will take quite a bit of time before we get there.
The ideals that Members have spoken about I would call, for now, utopian at best because there is no way we are in a position to implement them. That is not to say that we do not formulate policies that are meant to help in ensuring that in future people have decent housing.

Madam Speaker, I want to agree with some observations made by some Members. I remember personally years when I was in the Parliament of Uganda and Chair of the Committee on Housing. An attempt was made to upgrade one of the slum areas in Kampala. This was done and no sooner was it completed than the targeted groups sold off to those who had money and moved on to create another slum. *(Laughter)*

This happened and I saw it and I know the areas, I visited them and it is a kind of attitude by the people who dwell in these slums. They just don’t live there for the sake of living there because they can’t afford anything else but they have other agenda. And we see this happening now and again whenever there is a bit of an attempt to *Walk to Work* in Kampala, they are the one who *Walk to Work* and you wonder where they are going to work. The answer is obvious.

Madam Speaker, we as Council of Ministers is duty bound to look at these resolutions but we will need time to study them carefully – *(Applause)* - so that what we propose to the Partner States is manageable. It is no use writing things and bringing them and saying, here you are, when nothing can be done about them. I think we have to go step by step and as I said, we need time to look at these resolutions carefully, study them so that we can recommend what we think could be a starting point for us to move in the direction of eventually helping our people to get decent housing. Otherwise, Madam Speaker, I support the motion. Thank you.

*(Applause)*

**The Speaker:** Thank you, Chair, Council. Now I invite hon. Nancy Abisai to wind up debate.

**Ms Nancy Abisai (Kenya):** Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. I would like to take this opportunity to thank all the Members who have contributed to this motion, and very ably so, and given very useful input in terms of improving on some of the points.

I want from the onset to thank the Chair, Council of Ministers for giving very useful input. And of course I appreciate that you have been in this sector for many years and so you understand it extremely well and also to let you know that yes, everything is possible.

I want to mention some of the aspects and maybe conclude that; one, yes, the issue of equality as a key component of integration, I agree with that and I think it is something that we need to look at.

I also agree with hon. Kimbisa about developing survival mechanisms so that we could try and work put on some of the strategies of slum upgrading promotion.

Also the people who are doing businesses, yes it is important to know what it is that we can be able to do.

Marginalization and deprivation of citizens, yes, that is something that causes slum upgrading.

On issues of MDGs, yes, hon. Patricia raised that. Yes, it is true every MDG relates or interrelates to the other and particularly take note of national budgets. If we don’t provide for national budgets on the question of urbanization and housings then we cannot achieve on the issue of slum upgrading.

Of course hon. Sebalu and hon. Kiangoi also raised the issue of planned cities and I did start by saying that slums are an issue of failed policies and failed urban planning for our cities.

I want to recognize also the question of forced evictions especially by hon. Nakawuki. I think that is a very important aspect. We need to consider what happens to people when they don’t have good housing. They go and build in places where they are not supposed to build and they are gradually evicted from those places.

One of the Members who did not get a chance to speak but opted to give in writing – hon. Ogle – thinks that we need to re-examine whether we have cities in Africa or they are just big villages in terms of looking at some derogatory terms that were used to describe the cities like Nairobery – you know - because of what used to happen.

Madam Speaker, as I conclude, there are two suggestions of amendment to the motion on recommendations. I would like to say that of course in terms of the motion, there is need to have proper harmonization of policies.

Chair, Council, political good will and good governance, yes, it is important and we need to have a holistic approach in principle, in perspective and in practice.

Hon. Bazivamo proposed and I will read the proposed amendment: “The Assembly do resolve to urge Partner States to expedite the elaboration, adoption and implementation of the cities Master Plans, catering for different categories of housing to accommodate different categories of our cities’ population.” Yes, I will accept it because it is talking about the implementation of the cities Master Plans which also has to do with urban planning.
Hon. Nakawuki also added a recommendation that: “All EAC Partner States Governments should promote support services for the homeless and other vulnerable groups.” When you talk about the homeless and vulnerable groups, you are also talking about people without clear settlements. That means if you don’t cater for them, they will actually turn into slum dwellers.

Right now we are closing refugee camps because of issues of security. I think it is important that we look at how to settle the homeless and vulnerable groups without creating more slums because these people must find a place to live in. Even if it means looking for sharks, they will live there. So, Madam Speaker, I conclude with those remarks. I thank you. *(Applause)*

**The Speaker:** Thank you very much, hon. Nancy Abisai. Hon. Members, the motion on the floor is that the Assembly do resolve to urge the EAC Council of Ministers on strategies for slum upgrading and prevention in the East African Community region.

*(Question put, and agreed to)*

PRIVATE MEMBER’S BILL
THE EAST AFRICAN COMMUNITY CIVIC EDUCATION BILL, 2013

**Mr. Zein Abubakar (Kenya):** Thank you, Rt hon. Speaker. I stand under Article 59(1) of the Treaty and rule 64(8) and 64 (9) of the Rules of Procedure of the Assembly. In other words on behalf of the Committee on Regional Affairs and Conflict Resolution and on my own behalf to move the motion that this Assembly pursuant to the provisions of Article 59 (1) of the Treaty and Rule 64 of the Rules of Procedure of the Assembly do grant leave to the Chairperson of the Committee to introduce a Private Member’s Bill entitled: “The East African Community Civic Education Bill, 2013.” I beg to move, Madam Speaker.


**Mr. Zein:** Thank you once again, Rt hon. Speaker for giving me this opportunity. Given the hour, I will try to be precise and concise.

Madam Speaker, the efforts of the Committee of Regional Affairs and Conflict Resolution to introduce a Bill that seeks to establish an institutional framework to provide and address the question of civic education within the Community has a checkered past.

The Chair, emeritus hon. Abdu Karim and hon. Sebalu and the members of the Regional Affairs Committee in the Second Assembly, of which, Madam Speaker I am happily informed that you were such a member of this committee, had worked with hon. Amani Kaboru to introduce such a Bill before but it lapsed. And the committee felt that this matter is
so important that we should revive it and seek the consent of this honorable House to introduce a Bill that will address and fill the information knowledge gap that exists among the people of East Africa on the integration process.

Madam Speaker, Article 7 of the Treaty for the establishment of the EAC provides for a people centered and market driven economy. We all know that and many have observed that whereas the Partner States have dedicated tremendous efforts towards the market economy, there are still challenges on how to actualize a people centered community, particularly based on the deficit of information and knowledge on how citizens can meaningfully participate in the integration process.

Many studies have been done and all of them show that there are very low levels of information and knowledge that are possessed by our people on the integration process and all its stages but particularly soon the roles that the citizens can play in this integration process.

It is for this reason that the Regional Affairs and Conflict Resolution Committee has been inspired and directed to start this process of moving a private member’s motion on the establishment of an institutional framework for carrying out civic education.

Mr. Mathuki: Information.

The Speaker: Hon. Mathuki, I think the Member is justifying his motion. After he has finished justifying his motion, you will be able to debate. You have an opportunity to debate and give that information. Proceed, hon. Zein.

Mr. Zein: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The committee decided that this matter was so important that we did not want to move a Bill ad particularly in the context that a Bill had already been generated by the Second Assembly.

We organized expert hearings and interactions in all Partner States. We were able to hold one in Bujumbura, Burundi on 23rd September, 2013; Kampala, Uganda and Kigali, Rwanda on 24th September, 2013; and Nairobi, Kenya on 26th September, 2013 with institutional frameworks within those Partner States who are involved in carrying out civic education in Partner States. And they gave us very useful information.

One clear issue that had the support of all these Partner States experts and practitioners, both State and non-State practitioners, was that this idea is important and it is high time that it is actualized through a Bill to be brought before this House.

Madam Speaker, the object of this Bill, therefore, is to provide a legal framework within which the people of East Africa at all levels can be equipped with the necessary knowledge, information and skills about the affairs and how to participate in the affairs and activities of the Community.
For that purpose, the Bill will seek to establish a unit within the office of the Secretary General mandated to coordinate integration activities and the information that is necessary to facilitate the participation in those activities, develop relevant materials in terms of information and communication as well as education materials and set standards and quality control measures among other functions.

The respective national institutions currently responsible for carrying out civic education in Partner States are proposed to be national focal points for the purpose of this Bill.

Bearing in mind the public demand for such a Bill in the East African Community, Madam Speaker, I beg to move. Thank you. (Applause)

The Speaker: Thank you very much. Hon. Members, the motion on the floor is that pursuant to the provisions of Article 59 (1) of the Treaty and rule 64 of the Rules of Procedure of the Assembly, the Assembly grants leave to hon. Zein Abubakar to introduce a Private Member’s Bill entitled: “The East African Community Civic Education Bill, 2013.” Debate is open. Let me take hon. Halerimana and hon. Sebalu in that order.

Mr. Abdul Karim Harelimana (Rwanda): Thank you, Madam Speaker for giving me this opportunity. I rise to support the motion and I believe in it very much because historically, it started with the Second Assembly, coming from the workshop which we had in Bujumbura with different stakeholders including academicians, politicians and experts who among other recommendations recommended to EALA to come up with a Bill about civic education to our people.

Madam Speaker, I remember very well that you were a member of the Regional Affairs and Conflict Resolution Committee by then and you were not just a member but a very active one. You were present in that workshop and we were together during the different activities of the committee.

I remember that during one of our meetings with the people at the different borders between Kanyaru and Akanyaru, between Rwanda and Burundi; Manyovu and Mugina, that is, between Burundi and Tanzania; Gatuna and Katuna between Rwanda and Uganda; Mutukula, between Uganda and Tanzania; later on Sirari and Isibania, between Kenya and Tanzania; and Rusumu on both sides of Kenya and Tanzania, we learnt that when we talk about the Common Market, I will maybe translate in some of our local languages: Soko la pamoja; Isokoro rusanje in Kinyarwanda et cetera people though that it was just a big market built under one roof at the border so that they could transact their businesses there. So, this is the understanding of our people of the Common Market.

Madam Speaker, when we talk about Customs Union, maybe the business people will understand it, especially those big ones because they know what customs means. But the people at the borders will never know that what it means because for them – what is the
meaning of customs to them in the first place? Don’t talk about the Customs Union but what does “customs” only mean to them? They cross with their merchandise – small commodities – day or night – anytime they want- so, to them when you talk about the Customs Union, they don’t understand it at all.

When you tell them about the Political Federation of East Africa, that one day we shall have one country whereby we shall have one President, they don’t understand what you mean. Can Rwandese live without Paul Kagame as our President? Can we live with the Ugandans without Yoweri Kaguta Museveni? Do you mean we shall have someone like Obama in our region? They don’t understand you at all.

Madam Speaker, that is why I think that we badly need to educate our people; that is why we need this civic education Bill to be in place so that our people can really understand what we really mean. Thank you, Madam Speaker and I beg to support the motion. (Applause)

Mr. Mike Sebalu (Uganda): Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. I want to applaud the Chair of the Committee on Regional Affairs and Conflict Resolution for introducing this Bill. Equally, I would like to associate myself with the Chair of the Committee on Regional Affairs and Conflict Resolution emeritus who has just been on the floor and in the same vein I want to state that I am also associated with that committee right from the inception of this Bill.

It was well thought out; it came out of a very serious intellectual engagement with various stakeholders that included academia, private sector, civil society and other practitioners and we really felt in that meeting that there was need to streamline the way we manage the affairs of the Community and get people on board.

Madam Speaker, in the same spirit, I want to inform the process basing on our strategic plan 2012-2018, which is putting a lot of emphasis on the people centeredness in the process of integrating this region. We want to bring the people at the center of the integration agenda. We are not integrating countries; we are not integrating Governments; we are integrating people and we are integrating the people of East Africa. Therefore, for us to make meaningful engagement with them, we need to bring them on board. We need to get them to appreciate what it is that we are talking about to do with integration.

You will appreciate that integration is a very strategic issue. Definitely for you to expect my grandmother in the village to understand it off cuff would be over estimating her abilities. But as leaders, we have the responsibility of thinking and thinking strategically for the people that we lead. But after we have gone through the thought process, it is incumbent on us to bring the people on board; to unpack the technical issues that we may have conceptualized and make them basic for the people to appreciate.
In this regard, Madam Speaker, we need to empower our people with knowledge; we need to empower with information in order to create ownership for the people to appreciate the integration, to understand it and internalize it and, therefore, to participate from an informed position.

Finally, Madam Speaker - *(Interruption)*

**Mr. Mathuki:** Information, Madam Speaker.

**The Speaker:** I will give you time to make a substantive contribution.

**Mr. Mathuki:** No, I just want to give him information.

**The Speaker:** You know this motion - I think doesn’t have a lot of – are you opposing?

**Mr. Mathuki:** No, I support. I just want to give him an important piece of information related to what he is saying in a few seconds.

**The Speaker:** Okay, take it.

**Mr. Mathuki:** Thank you very much, Madam Speaker and I support the motion obviously but what I am going to tell – thank you hon. Sebalu for giving way. You may wish to know that in the Kenyan context, H.E. the President of the Republic of Kenya has set aside some funds for what we call the Kenyan tour. And I think this will go a long way in trying to reach put to the people of the Republic of Kenya to ensure that they are sensitized. I thought that this is important information that should be coming in within this financial year. Of course now again if that can be replicated in other Partner States it will be very important in as far as enhancing this issue of civic education. Thank you very much. *(Applause)*

**The Speaker:** We shall laud him tomorrow when we get the opportunity of him being amidst us. Hon. Sebalu, try to wind up very fast

**Mr. Sebalu:** Yeah. Thank you, Madam Speaker. I want to appreciate that spirit of complementarity towards this initiative. But the Bill seeks to create a harmonized way of dealing with this issue of getting the people on board so that we get information that is packaged in a similar way so that what is being disseminated in Kampala is the same in Arusha and other places.

Finally, Madam Speaker, we need to unpack these very highly technical concepts to make them basic and easily understandable by the ordinary people and this law seeks to do exactly that. With those brief comments of support, I beg to support.

**The Speaker:** I will take hon. hafsa Mossi. Allow me do that so that we are able to conclude on this debate.
Ms Hafsa Mossi (Burundi): Thank you, Madam Speaker for giving me this opportunity. I want to support this motion and also to congratulate the mover. If he allows me, I would like to make a small amendment which will allow the motion to focus more on youth.

The Speaker: Hon. Hafsa, the motion as it is currently is just seeking leave to be granted to hon. Zein to move it. When leave is granted, then you will be able to work with the committee or hon. Zein to make those amendments.

Ms Mossi: Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The Speaker: Hon. Members, I know hon. Rwigema and hon. Mbidde wished to make comments or to contribute to this motion but recognizing that the time is not really on our side, I suggest that we proceed by inviting hon. Zein to conclude on this so that we are able to proceed.

Mr. Zein Abubakar (Kenya): Thank you, Rt hon. Speaker. I would like to thank those who got an opportunity to speak; hon. Abdu Karim, hon. Sebalu and hon. Hafsa Mossi but also thank hon. Mathuki for the information that he provided.

Madam Speaker, because of the hour, I would like just to say two things; one, that the committee and I would be particularly grateful if this House finds it desirable to grant is leave to introduce such a bill.

Two, we promise to seek to work with the House to make sure that we have a good proposed law that will deliver for our people the necessary information, knowledge, skills and attitudes that are required in order to fully and meaningfully participate in the integration process. I thank you very much, Madam Speaker and I beg to move.

The Speaker: Thank you very much, hon. Zein. Hon. Members, the motion on the floor is that this Assembly pursuant to the provisions of Article 59 (1) of the Treaty and rule 64 of the Rules of Procedure of the Assembly, do grants leave to hon. Zein Abubakar to introduce a Private Member’s Bill entitled: “The East African Community Civic Education Bill, 2013.”

(Question put, and agreed to.)

MOTION

REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON COMMUNICATIONS, TRADE AND INVESTMENT ON THE ONSPOT ASSESSMENT OF REGIONAL COOPERATION IN ICT

The Chairperson of The Committee on Communications, Trade and Investment (Ms Angela Kizigha): Thank you, Madam Speaker. I beg to lay the report of the Committee on Communications, Trade and Investment on the on spot Assessment of Regional Cooperation in ICT. I beg to move.
Ms Kizigha: Thank you, Madam Speaker once again. Rt hon. Speaker, I thank you for giving me this opportunity to present a report on the on spot assessment of regional cooperation in ICT.

Madam Speaker, before I proceed with the report, allow me to add my voice to the rest in expressing my sincere appreciation and thanks to the Government of the Republic of Kenya and the EALA Kenyan Chapter members for the warm welcome extended to us - (Applause) - here in this beautiful city of Nairobi. A city I personally regard as a home away from home. Madam Speaker, we are really enjoying our stay and thank you once again for the warm welcome.

Madam Speaker, once again before I proceed with the report, allow me to inform you personally and hon. Members, on a serious note, that I regret to inform the House of the death of a young East African Jerry Isaac Mruma, a student of USIE here in Nairobi who died on 17th November, 2013 at the age of 23.

The late Isaac Mruma is of Tanzanian and origin went missing on the night of 16th November 2013 after attending a Tanzanian Night function at the Pan-African Hotel. He was a scholar of USIE pursuing his master’s in public administration. His body was found the next day with a deep cut on the head. It is suspected that he was murdered and dumped elsewhere.

Madam Speaker, as I speak here now, the police are still investigating the incidence. The late Jerry Isaac Mruma is to be buried in Dar es Salaam, if God wishes, tomorrow. I wish to say that the region is losing very many young people due to the rising levels of crime and the matter needs to be addressed.

Even our Deputy Minister of Home Affairs yesterday got a problem of one of his close relatives who was injured around the same place where the body of the late Isaac was found.

Madam Speaker, I appeal to the police and security authorities – since our Minister of EAC from Kenya is here - to kindly ensure safety of citizens throughout so that they can move freely and are able to contribute to the building of the economy of this great region.

Madam Speaker, having given this information to the hon. Members, allow me now proceed with the report on the on spot assessment of regional cooperation in ICT. I thank you, Madam Speaker. I now proceed to read the report.
BACKGROUND

Pursuant to article 49 (2) (e), "the Assembly may for purposes of carrying out its functions, establish any Committee or committees for such purposes as it may deem necessary to exercise both legislative and oversight functions on all matters within the scope of the EAC through meetings, studies, workshops; tours, on spot assessment activities, to mention but a few.

It is in the same vein, the Committee on Communication, Trade and Investment carried out the oversight activity to establish and understand from stakeholders which or whether there are Initiatives and mechanisms in place to regulate, harmonize and implement ICT policies in the EAC region. The implementation of these policies will improve the quality and affordable cost of cross-border communications and also facilitate the implementation of some EAC integration projects such as the Single Customs Territory (SCT).

Objectives of the On-Spot assessment

The overall objective of the on-spot assessment was to assess Initiatives and mechanisms in place to regulate, harmonize and implement ICT policies in the EAC region. The specific objectives were to update Members on the status on:

1. Cross-Border Broadband ICT Infrastructure Networks;
2. International Mobile Roaming Services including telecommunication networks and connection tariffs in the region;
3. Analog-To-Digital Broadcast Migration;
4. Framework for Cyber laws;
5. E-Government frameworks;
6. Come up with recommendations on the way forward.

Methodology

Madam Speaker, the Committee Members were divided into two groups, one group covered Dar es Salaam Tanzania and Kampala Uganda while the other group covered Bujumbura Burundi and Kigali Rwanda and both groups gathered in Nairobi Kenya. The Committee held interactive meetings with relevant Ministries, Regulatory Bodies and telecommunication Operators. The proceedings of the meetings were in form of Paper presentations, and plenary discussions between Members and various stakeholders.

EMERGING ISSUES

Cross-Border Broadband ICT Infrastructure Networks

Since 2005 both Government and private sector operators have implemented optical fibre
Backbone infrastructure (OFBI) within partner states. There have also been initiatives to implement cross border Optic Fiber Backbone as this will facilitate the integration of ICT Networks, hence improve quality and affordable cost of cross-border communications. In addition cross-border broadband connectivity is required for implementation of some EAC integration projects such as EAC Single customs territory.

The EAC region has seen spectacular growth in broadband ICT infrastructure which is partly attributed to the arrival of four undersea cables (EASSY, SEACOM, TEAMS and LION 2) on the East African Coast. This has resulted into more international capacity/bandwidth, diversity in routes, more competition and a drop in international connectivity rates. This has been complemented by governments’ sponsored National Optic Fibre Backbone Infrastructure in nearly all the EAC Partner States.

Although Tanzania provided backhaul connectivity/links to all EAC Partner States followed by Kenya on some border areas, the challenge of interconnectivity among other Partner States in the region and cost of international bandwidth especially for land locked countries still exists.

Challenges faced by Cross-Border Broadband ICT Infrastructure Networks in the EAC

i) High pricing of cross-border broadband bandwidth. The cost reductions to service providers are not translating to price reductions to end users.
iii) Lack of regulatory framework to facilitate cross-border Optic Fibre Backbone interconnections.
iv) Fibre cuts.

Specific Country Situations

In The United Republic of Tanzania
The Optic Fibre backbone project is handled by the government and it is connected to all EAC Partner States. The Optic Fibre Backbone Project is managed under Public Private Partnership arrangement although the ownership belongs to the government. At a regional level, Tanzania is also in collaboration with the East African Communication Organisation.

In The Republic of Uganda

i) The National Backbone Infrastructure is connected to Malaba and Busia on side of Kenya and it extends to South Sudan at Nimule.
ii) The National Backbone Infrastructure connectivity will be extended to Tanzania through Mutukula and to Rwanda through Katuna.
iii) Procurement of a consultant to conduct a feasibility study on missing links is in progress.
iv) Uganda is working on a Broad Band Policy for the country that will address these matters.
In The Republic of Kenya

i) In Kenya the National optic fibre backbone Infrastructure has been laid across the country which interconnects most districts in the country. It has an extension of 4,500km, and 60 sites in 29 counties providing faster internet and implementation of e-Government initiatives.

ii) The Optic Fibre Backbone is already connected to Uganda via Busia and Tanzania via Namanga in terms of EAC regional interconnection.

iii) Fast truck Phase 2 of National Optic Fiber Backbone to cover the missing links and address the problem of redundant link.

iv) Regulatory framework to facilitate cross border Optic Fiber Backbone interconnections and bandwidth pricing.

In The Republic of Burundi

Burundi Backbone Systems (BBS):

i) Public Private Partnership with the support of the World Bank;

ii) ONATEL is the 2nd stakeholder;

iii) The total length of Burundi Backbone System is 1250 kms;

iv) Total Capacity at the beginning is 10 Gbits/s National and 300/600Mbits for International;

v) Burundi Backbone System was launched in September 2013 and it will connect all provinces and main cities;

vi) Burundi Backbone System intends to connect on submarine optical cables through Rwanda at Akanyaru and Kabanga with Tanzania. The redundancy of the main core of the Burundi Backbone System network is done in some hilly regions by radio links.

vii) No independent ICT Regulatory Body.

The following are Broadband services to be provided to customers through the Metropolitan Area Network:-

i) Data Center;

ii) Data, Internet and Voice in one bouquet;

iii) Hosting of Web and Mail servers into Burundi Backbone Systems;

iv) Cloud computing.

In The Republic of Rwanda

Currently Optical Fibre Backbone Infrastructure (OFBI) is installed connecting all thirty (30) districts of Rwanda together with all the 9 borders of the neighboring countries. The next step is to extend broadband connectivity to various institutions and households as the last mile solution.

In terms of Regulatory framework for cross-border interconnections, there is no established
framework for cross-border interconnections of OFBI in no man’s land at the countries’ border points. Therefore there is a need to have a clear framework recognized by all Partner States.

Pricing of cross-border bandwidth is currently applied by the 3 main bandwidth providers in Rwanda (MTN, BSC and Liquid Telecom Rwanda) are set freely without intervention from Regulator.

INTERNATIONAL MOBILE ROAMING SERVICES (IMRS) IN THE REGION

Roaming within the Community began way back in the late 1990s, when mobile networks were first introduced in the Partner States. Thanks to spectacular growth in mobile communications services, roaming is estimated to have been growing ever since.

Cross-border movement of persons has grown tremendously in the Community largely due to the revival of the EAC integration process under the establishment of the EAC common market. This has resulted into a corresponding growth in the demand for roaming services.

Despite the growth in the demand for roaming services, roaming services is a persisting challenge due to the following factors:-

1) Weak/Limited Competitive Forces in the Roaming Market Segment and therefore Limited or No Consumer Choices Available.

2) No direct connectivity between most of the regional countries therefore traffic for the region is handled by international carriers which increases on the cost of roaming.

3) Regional Regulatory issues on International Mobile Roaming
   i) There is no Regulatory oversight on Roaming Cross Border Services in the EAC region
   ii) Roaming Service including tariffs guided by bilateral agreements between the home and host operator
   iii) No transparency in the pricing methodology
   iv) Significant tariff differentials while roaming on different networks within the host country in EAC
   v) No Prompt Roaming Notifications
   vi) Jurisdictional Limitations of Existing National Laws and Regulatory Frameworks over Regional Interconnection, Tariffs and Competition Issues

4) New International voice calling charges
   i) EAC Member States of Burundi, Rwanda, Tanzania and Uganda have installed a monitoring tool referred to as International Gateway Traffic Verification System to monitor all incoming international traffic. The aim of this system is to eliminate illegal and Fraudulent Traffic Terminated in these Countries and increase traffic
reporting transparency.

ii) These Countries have also introduced an additional tax to incoming traffic called Surcharge on International Inbound Call Termination (“SIIT”). The tax is prescribed by the regulator and applied by the operator. New levy informed by governments’ concern that Telecommunication companies are under-reporting international calls—thus denying governments’ revenue. Revenue collected is shared between Operators and National Treasuries for the System management and maintenance Charges.

Madam Speaker, the self-explanatory is illustrated below.

**ILLUSTRATION: OPERATORS “X’s” Mobile Voice Roaming Charges in EAC in KShs.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Rwanda</th>
<th>Tanzania</th>
<th>Uganda</th>
<th>Burundi (USD)</th>
<th>EU (Kshs)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Incoming calls per minute (Received Calls)</td>
<td>28.00</td>
<td>20.67</td>
<td>9.00</td>
<td>0.32</td>
<td>0.07 (Kshs 8.12)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outgoing calls to new Country per minute</td>
<td>21.25</td>
<td>27.00</td>
<td>18.98</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.24 (Kshs 27.85)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outgoing calls to Home Country per minute</td>
<td>18.50</td>
<td>27.50</td>
<td>18.33</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Impact of the Surcharge on International Incoming Call Prices**

i) *Reduction in incoming international traffic:* Most operators abroad will adjust prices immediately to reflect new cost as a result of the tax. That will in turn reduce the volume of calls coming into the affected country.

ii) *Reduction in Outgoing international traffic:* As local operators increase International Termination Rates, other operators abroad will increase their termination rates in reciprocation to take care of increased cost of connecting international calls. This will cause a reduction in outgoing international call volumes.

iii) *Increase in illegal traffic termination:* Increased international termination rates and lower local tariffs present an attractive arbitrage opportunity for SIMBOX and grey route operators to thrive. This will contribute immensely to reduced traffic and affect the anticipated revenue/taxes to the government.

iv) Poor service quality provided to the subscribers/customers.

**ANALOG-TO-DIGITAL BROADCAST MIGRATION**

According to the Geneva 2006 Agreement on digital broadcasting, countries are required to
migrate their terrestrial television broadcast services from analog technology to digital technology by 30th June 2015. In May 2011, EAC Partner States developed and adopted a roadmap for Analog-to-Digital Broadcast Migration, and agreed on a switchover date of 31st December 2012.

This deadline passed due to a number of intervening factors not met by all Partner States except Tanzania where analogue TV was switched off on 31st December 2012 starting with Dar es Salaam, Arusha, Mwanza, Dodoma, Moshi, Mbeya and Tanga. Tanzania is ahead of other EAC Partner States in terms of analog to digital migration implementation process.

Other Countries are progressing on well with the migration process despite a number of policy and technical challenges and have planned to switch over before the global deadline of 30th June 2015.

**In The Republic of Uganda**

i) Licenses have been developed;

ii) GE06 Plan validated;

iii) Minimum standards for set top boxes developed;

iv) Sensitization of broadcasters;

v) Nationwide consumer awareness campaign.

**In The Republic of Kenya**

i) A multi-stakeholder Digital Television Committee established to Direct a seamless migration from analogue to digital broadcasting;

ii) Agreed on June 2014 switch-off date to be carried out in phases;

iii) Phase 1: 13th Dec 2013- Nairobi;

iv) Phase 2: 30th March 2014 – 8 major towns ;

v) Phase 3: 30th June 2014: The rest of the sites.

**In The Republic of Rwanda**

i) Currently, the digital TV Broadcasting Network of Rwanda Broadcasting Agency (RBA) is up and running with an estimate coverage of 95% of the entire country;

ii) Regulations governing digital terrestrial television have been established and technical specifications for STBs have been published to allow importers and vendors of equipment to avail them on the market;

iii) Two Signal distributors shall be allowed (one for the Public TV broadcaster RBA and another one will be private in the name of PANAFRICA Network Rwanda Ltd;

iv) 3 STBs importers have been Licensed (TELE10, TRANSAFRICAN CONTAINER and SORIM) in addition to StarTimes which has started to upgrade its decoders so that they can display Free to Air Channel broadcasted by RBA;
Dual illumination started in March 2013 with a plan to start progressive analogue switch off by 1st July 2013;

Unfortunately, by July 2013 there were no decoders on the market. However a new switch off plan will commence once decoders are available on the market.

In The Republic of Burundi
In Burundi, the migration from Analog to Digital Broadcasting is in progress and it will be achieved by June 2015.

Challenges encountered in the Digital Migration process
i) High capital requirement for Digital Television Technology infrastructure;
ii) Policy on the number of signal distributors especially in light of technology advancements;
iii) Availability and affordability of set top boxes and decoders to access digital content;
iv) Funding for digital migration;
v) Litigation hampering switch off timelines;
vi) Insufficient content;
vii) Political interferences on the regulators operations.

Mitigating Factors
i) Zero rating of taxes on digital receivers;
ii) Funding Mechanisms for migration;
iii) Stakeholders involvement;
iv) Incentivize content development.

Benefits of Digital Broadcasting Coverage
It is expected that broadcast connectivity in the Countries will catalyze the socio-economic growth through:-

i) Job Creation;
ii) Enhanced access to information/Awareness;
iii) Enhanced citizens’ education and involvement in development projects;
iv) Increase of the bandwidth strength.

EAC FRAMEWORK FOR CYBER LAWS
The EAC cyberlaw Reform programme which began in 2006 was a collaboration effort between EAC and the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UCTAD). The objective of the programme was to develop harmonized frameworks on the form of guidelines, to assist partner states to enact and implement national legislation for cyberspace.

Two sets of such frameworks have been developed. These are EAC Framework for cyberlaws
Phase 1 (Framework I) and cyberlaws Phase II (Framework II). Framework I was approved by the Council in 2010 and its implementation is in progress. Framework II was considered and approved for implementation by the 10th Meeting of the Sectoral Council on Transport Communications and Meteorology (TCM) in August 2013.

**Under Framework I**

i) Electronic Transactions;
ii) Electronic signatures Authentications;
iii) Cybercrime;
iv) Consumer protection;
v) Data protection and privacy.

**Framework II**

i) Intellectual property;
ii) Competition;
iii) E-taxation;
iv) Information Security.

Although most of the EAC Countries have enacted the relevant cyber laws, two major challenges still remain, these are:-

i) Slow implementation of these laws due to delay in putting in place the necessary Regulations and other structures for example Public Key Infrastructure for e-signature;
ii) The delay in setting up national Computer Emergency Response Teams (CERTS) in some EAC countries and linking of these CERTS into a regional Computer Emergency Response Team. CERTS are Mandated to offer advice on cyber security matters nationally and to coordinate response to cyber incidents in collaboration with relevant stakeholders;

iii) Therefore due to the above and other related issues, there is need for EAC intervention and support in terms of technical and institutional capacity building and other necessary legal and regulatory frameworks.

**In The United Republic of Tanzania**

The government is in the process of establishing the cyberlaws. Already the following draft laws are in place:- Electronic Transaction Bill, Cyber Security and Data Protection Bill.

**In The Republic of Uganda:**

**Under Framework I**


ii) Electronic Transactions Regulations and Electronic Signatures Regulations have been
developed and were gazetted on 30th September 2013. These Regulations operationalize the principle Acts.

iii) Data Protection and Privacy Bill is being developed.

**Under Framework II**

i) National Information Security Framework is being developed. The framework.

ii) 16 Standards for Information Security have been developed and were gazetted on 12th April 2013.

**In The Republic of Kenya**

i) Policy, Legal & Regulatory Framework in Kenya. In progress, there is development of a Certification Service Providers licensing framework to spell out the requirements of setting up and providing digital certification services and the establishment of a National Computer Incident Response Team (CIRT).

ii) Establishment of the Kenya Computer Incident Response Team Coordination Centre (KE-CIRT/CC). This is also Kenya’s national trusted cybercrime management point of contact.

iii) At a Regional Level, Collaboration with the other East Africa national Computer Incident Response Teams under the EACO Cyber security taskforce which is chaired by Kenya.

iv) Globally it collaborates with national CIRTs in jurisdictions outside of East Africa such as the US-CERT and the Japanese CERT (JP-CERT), among others.

**In The Republic of Rwanda**

**Under Framework I**

i) Implementation of the National Root Certification Authority & Government Certification Authority. This will ensure secure Electronic Transactions and Authentication.

ii) Draft Regulation governing Certification Authorities in Rwanda;

iii) Regulation of the National Bank of Rwanda Governing payment services Providers was put in place and established a Regulatory Framework For Mobile Money Transactions.


v) Data Protection related to telecommunications matters is covered in the ICT Bill.

vi) The law establishing RURA provides the mandate to protect the consumers in the regulated sectors including ICTs.

vii) It is in this context that RURA developed some regulations related to Consumer Protection.

viii) ICT Bill has taken into consideration and the Consumer Protection in E-Commerce.
**Under Framework II**

i) The law related to Intellectual property has been enacted;

ii) The Law establishing the National Standards Inspectorate, competition and Consumer Protection Authority (NICA) has been enacted. The other institutions dealing with competition in specific areas are Rwanda Utilities Regulatory Authority and National Bank of Rwanda;

iii) E-taxation projects have been implemented (ASCUDA, SIGTAS, Single electronic window, e-declaration, M-payment of taxes);


---

**E-GOVERNMENT FRAMEWORKS**

The EAC Regional Strategy was approved by the council in 2006. The Strategy underscored the necessity for Partner states to develop and implement ICT applications and services for public service delivery e.g. e-immigration, e-health, integrated Financial Management Systems, e-procurement. As a prerequisite for sustainable implementation of e-government services, the strategy recommended that partner states should:

i) Establish the enabling legal environment by enacting and implementing cyberlaws;

ii) Develop and implement instruments for standardizing systems to ensure quality and interoperability and Implement institutional Frameworks that facilitate interdepartmental coordination.

Governments in the EAC Partner States have taken steps to develop relevant infrastructure and e-government systems although there are other barriers that have retarded progress in this area. These include poor connectivity and internet access, cost of bandwidth, inadequate budgets for ICT Ministries, ICT skills gaps among government employees and citizens to mention but a few.

---

**In The United Republic of Tanzania**

The government established a special Agency responsible electronic government services and the implementation of the whole process is in good progress. In terms of content sharing at a regional level, the East African Communications Organization is engaging all stakeholders to come up modalities on how to share content regionally, however there are still legal issues that are yet to be harmonized.
In The Republic of Uganda

i) Procurement is on-going for Integrating Government Applications to form a Government Integration Layer as a basis for developing and delivering innovative e-Government Services;

ii) Government Interoperability Framework is being developed. A concept paper and roadmap for development of an e-government interoperability framework have been developed. The framework will be developed in the next financial year 2014/15;

iii) National Information Technology Authority NITA-U has the mandate on behalf of the Government of Uganda to promote and provide technical guidance for the establishment of e-Government, e-Commerce and other e-Transactions in Uganda. NITA-U has the Directorate of e-Government whose sole purpose is the implementation of e-Government;

iv) Government of Uganda completed an e-Government Readiness survey in 2012;

v) An e-Government Master Plan has been developed in collaboration with the Government of South Korea to guide implementation of e-Government services.

In The Republic of Kenya

The E-Government strategy is driven by the ICT authority, and to create an enabling environment the Kenyan Government has carried out a number of initiatives:-

i) Development of an ICT Master plan 2013-2017. The Government through the ICT Authority has come up with an ICT Master Plan dubbed 'connected Kenya 2017’ which aims at building and promoting an environment where more service sector businesses are created and are able to thrive through leveraging on ICT;

ii) Broadband strategy 2013-2017 has been developed to provide quality broad band services to all citizens and the mission is ; 'Broadband connectivity that is always on and that delivers a minimum of 5mbps to homes and businesses for high speed access to voice, data, video and applications for development;

iii) This will help in economic growth, employment creation, growth of investment opportunities, access to online government services, improved education and training services;

iv) Infrastructure development. To secure online content and promote e-commerce the Government is implementing the Public Key infrastructure (PKI) to provide digital certification services;

v) PKI project will help set up an online identity and verification system where each citizen will be issued with a unique online identity (digital certificate) that will be required whenever they take part in online transactions;

vi) Electronic signing is made to solve a lot of the on-line crimes such as hacking, identity theft and forgery of sensitive information;

vii) County connectivity project (CCP). This is an initiative that aims to provide connectivity to government offices in the identified counties and establishment of an integrated communication system.
In The Republic of Rwanda

1. National information and communication infrastructure I, II, III are available;
2. Government of Rwanda put in place an E-Gov interoperability framework;
3. Partnership between Government of Rwanda and National IT Promotion Agency (NIPA) of South Korea in development of a comprehensive e-government Master Plan;
4. Through PPP, a company that will deal with system integration of ICT solutions including E-Gov applications was created;
5. Rwanda Development Board as an implementing agency is necessary for proper coordination of all Government projects including E-Government services.

EAST AFRICAN COMMUNICATIONS ORGANISATIONS (EACO)

1) EACO is a regional ICT organization which under a Public Private Partnership arrangement brings together national ICT regulators, telecom, broadcasting, and postal operators/service providers, academia, and other associated stakeholders in the EAC Partner States.

2) Its objective is to strengthen and promote cooperation among the EAC Partner States in the development of telecom, postal and broadcasting services in East Africa.

3) EACO facilitates joint discussion and identification of solutions by regulators and operators in the East African region.

4) EACO has a lot of vested information that can help to build a sustainable communication sector and take advantage of the opportunities created by the global ICT revolution.

5) EACO has also applied for observer status in the EAC.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. The Committee recommends to the Assembly to urge the EAC Council of Ministers to put more efforts in the implementation of cross-border broadband networks to facilitate the integration of ICT networks and applications leading to quality and affordable cost of cross-border communications that is required for the implementation of some EAC integration projects such as the EAC Single Customs Territory and the Common Market Protocol in general;

2. The Committee recommends to the Assembly to urge the Council of Ministers to expedite the study which will assess and recommend policy options for an appropriate
regulatory framework for regional communication and roaming within the Community;

3. The Committee recommends to the Assembly to urge the Council of Ministers to intervene and assist to resolve emerging cross border competition and interconnection agreement issues;

4. The Committee recommends to the Assembly to urge the Council to review the position on New Charges on Regional International Traffic by:-
   i) Introducing of uniform Price Cap Regulation for Roaming within EAC;
   ii) The EAC Council of Ministers should urge Partner States to removal of the Surtax International Inbound Termination (SIIT) as it has a negative impact on trade in the region including high tariffs on international calls and roaming rates;

5. Regulators should encourage all telecommunication operators in the East African region to adopt one network approach as applied by Airtel Telecommunication Company;

6. Regulators should address barriers that increase costs for service providers and consumers, such as double taxation and direct connectivity;

7. Regulators should encourage operators to continue to take measures that enhance and increase awareness and transparency on roaming service prices;

8. The Committee recommends to the Assembly to urge the Council to compel Partner states to come up with a harmonized regional framework and approach in implementation of ICT services that inter-alia, provide for independence of regulatory bodies;

9. The Committee recommends to the Assembly to urge Partner States to build capacities of the ICT implementing agencies and support the establishment of the necessary e-government infrastructure and systems;

10. The Committee recommends to the Assembly to urge the Council to consider granting the observer status to the East African Communications Organization;

11. The Committee recommends to the Assembly to urge the Council to adopt a new switch off deadline from Analog to Digital broadcasting by Partner States;

12. A stronger cooperation and partnership between EAC and East African Communication Organization (EACO) should be enhanced to create synergies and eventually contribute to the building of a competitive knowledge economy in East Africa.

CONCLUSION

Madam Speaker, considering that the region has made important strides in the development of the necessary ICT Policy and regulatory frameworks, policy makers and regulators should in the
wake of a growing ICT market and changing ICT environment, emphasize timely implementation and update of their national policies and e-strategies.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Madam Speaker, the committee wishes to express its appreciation to the Assembly and other stakeholders for the commitment and support offered to successfully hold this on-spot assessment.

I thank very much Madam Speaker.

(Applause)

The Speaker: Thank you for that very important report. Hon. Members, I appreciate that we have run out of time. This has been occasioned by the fact that our program of the session was altered slightly from the earlier one as we had we had envisaged it and this may be the last day of this session when we can have debate. So, it was important that we have this report. And allow me to say that because of the fact that even the Minister of EAC, hon. Kandie has given us an invitation which you all have, I just ask for a bout ten minutes to debate this report very quickly.

I will request that if you don’t mind, particularly those Members who are not members of the committee, will take the first priority on this debate so that we are able to quicken the process and conclude.

Hon. Members, the motion on the floor is that the report of the Committee on Communications, Trade and Investment on the on spot Assessment of Regional Cooperation in ICT be adopted. Debate is open.

The Speaker: Procedure, hon. Ogle.

Mr. Ogle: Madam Speaker, with your permission, I would just like your guidance because I remember when the committee did this on the spot assessment in this very critical area, there was an equally critical event that happened in the region. This was the meeting of three Partner States in Kigali - there was the Kigali Summit on ICT and the Heads of State at that meeting might have signed some protocol which perhaps was part of this report. It would have informed this House so as to debate better. Will it not be better perhaps, Madam Speaker, that you postpone this debate and ensure at some point that that report is incorporated?

The Speaker: Point of Order, hon. Dora.
Ms Byamukama: I hesitate to rise on a Point of Order, Madam Speaker. The rules are clear that we do not work in the context of speculation. And considering that the on spot assessment considered opinions and information of stakeholders from all the five Partner States, I think it may not be in order for us to stop the procedure on a point of speculation. Is it, therefore, in order for hon. Ogle to move on this point of speculation?

The Speaker: The available information doesn’t indicate that this information or protocol is available. So, I think it is not in order for us to stop debate under the pretext that there is some other information.

(Applause)

Ms Bhanji: Madam Speaker, I am standing here to request you that we postpone this debate so that we debate during the Kampala plenary. This is a very important agenda for the east Africans. This agenda is not about Members of Parliament of the East African Legislative Assembly.

Madam Speaker, this report is in the hands of all the Members of this Assembly. It is only proper that all Members of this House go and study it, do a thorough research in addition to what our committee did. So, Madam Speaker, I am requesting - because this is a very important agenda for the East Africans - that we don’t debate this report today but do that during the Kampala plenary. Thank you. (Hon. Kiangoi rose)

The Speaker: Hon. Kiangoi, please take your seat. Hon. Shy-Rose has moved on a Point of Order but I think it was not right for her to move under a Point of Order. You should have moved under a motion. And under a motion, it would have given you the opportunity to propose that we suspend debate. So, I think you are not in order and in that respect debate is open. I will take hon. Straton followed by hon. Yves.

Mr. Straton Ndikuryayo (Rwanda): Thank you, Madam Speaker. First of all, let me join my colleagues in thanking the Government of Kenya, the Kenya National Parliament and the EALA Kenyan Chapter for the warm welcome they have accorded to us since our arrival here, in Nairobi.

Madam Speaker, during our exercise although some are saying there is further information, I would like mention that we met several stakeholders including people from regulatory bodies, operators, internet service providers, people from revenue collections institutions, people from consumer protection associations, people from ICT ministries and authorities and also the people from the East African communications organizations.

Madam Speaker, because of the limited time, I would like to touch on three specific areas; one is the issue of the status of our regulatory bodies. You should be informed that regulatory bodies of our Partner States don’t have similar status in terms of independence.
All our Member States are members of the Telecommunications Union and the ICT regulatory reform from ITU includes measures aimed at:

(i) Creating independent entities to oversee the introduction of competition in the market and establish regulatory mechanisms;

(ii) To prepare the incumbent operator to face competition including setting deadlines determination of market exclusivity;

(iii) Allocating and managing scarce resources such as numbers and distinct resources in a non-discriminatory way within our liberalized market,

(iv) Expanding and enhancing access through telecommunications and ICT networks and services; and

(v) Promoting and protecting consumers’ interests including universal services and privacy.

Madam Speaker, in our context, our end prime goal here is in East Africa is just one having our regulatory bodies in our Partner States working independently. It is a requirement from IT reference No. 1.

On the technical side, it is just having:

(i) Effective and robust competition markets;

(ii) Protecting our consumers interests; and

(iii) Widespread the accessible networks and the services within our region.

This will go together with those optical fiber backbone infrastructure projects. Partner States implemented this project from 2005 but up to now much as the infrastructures are there, they are redundant. They are not interlinked because of some challenges like those highlighted in the report; one is lack of regulatory framework for managing the cross border interconnections in general but specifically in no man’s land area.

So, Madam Speaker, this should come with regulatory framework polices at our EAC level to address these issues.

I would also like to talk about the East African Community Communications Organization (EACO). Madam Speaker, when we went to Kigali we met the boss for EACO and he raised the concern that they have many programs they are doing; they are well formed bringing together all stakeholders including ICT regulators, operator services providers, trading institutions and other stakeholders in communication area but there is no interface with EAC organs – ICT department officials and also with EALA through the CTI Committee, which deals with ICT matters.
Madam Speaker, the other points will be pointed out by my colleagues. I would like to end by saying that we should move by first integrating our networks like Airtel did. Now we are enjoying Airtel. Now I am using Airtel and if one is calling from Rwanda, I am not being charged for roaming services. But my MTN is off now.

With those few remarks, I fully support the report. Thank you.

**The Speaker:** I will take hon. Yves Nsabimana.

**Mr. Yves Nsabimana (Burundi):** Thank you, Madam Speaker. When we were doing this on the spot assessment of ICT, we found that we had different legal framework of the regulatory authorities. In some Partner States, the regulatory bodies are independent but in others like Burundi, the regulatory authority is a government service.

The consequence of this situation is that it is very difficult for the region to have a harmonized framework in this sector and hence to have harmonized policies. And the position provided by the regulatory organ will be different according to their statutes. If the regulatory authority is independent, the cost of the presentation should be provided with a fee and an income to be off the organ. But if the regulatory is a government service, this fee becomes a tax to be approved by the Assembly and to be put in the national budget.

You understand, Madam Speaker, that when it comes to change it, it takes a very long process and also when the officials participate in international or regional meetings, they can’t take or sign any decision. They will have to report to their respective Governments and request for approval, which can take a lot of time and of course delay the implementation of the resolutions taken or concluded with the other partners.

This is why our committee urges this august House to recommend to the Council of Ministers to request the Partner States to implement the International Telecommunication Union recommendation which says that the regulatory body must be independent. This is very important. *(Applause)*

When it comes to increasing of the tariff of international and regional incoming calls in our respective Partner States, the objective of these decisions made by the different regulatory bodies or Governments services was to:

(i) Have a budget to buy equipment to control the incoming calls; and

(ii) Increase the revenues from the international incoming calls to enable the different Partner States have more incoming tax or more VAT.

But the result of this decisions are the opposite of what they were looking for because when they put these new tariffs, the Partner States reciprocated the measures taken and it increased the incoming calls tariff and the outgoing tariffs. Therefore, this business becomes expensive and
not profitable for the operators. That is why the operators find another way of pushing the traffic.

They are using some compressed routes which are not costly and the quality of the services ends up being very poor. We have a call rate that on every 20 calls initiated, only one succeeds. You can see how our sisters, daughters and brothers in Europe, America, or Canada have difficulty to reach us. This is why you have seen that these days they send you a message saying, “Call me back,” because they can hardly succeed to communicate with us.

And also the business man will increase the costs because they factor in these prices on the price of goods. Now this politics becomes an inflationist one - it creates inflation in the region.

The other consequence of this since they intended to increase the revenue only backfired and most operators say they have lost business. I can give you an example, in Burundi Airtel used to have 1 million minutes a month in incoming calls but now they have only 250,000. They have lost 750,000 minutes, which is a very high amount of revenue; U Call have lost more than 600 minutes and the roaming now is very bad. They cannot succeed in roaming.

So, Madam Speaker, this is a very bad thing for the citizens. It is a bad thing for doing business because it increases prices of goods and the people cannot move very easily in the region. So, that is why we request the Council of Ministers to come up with a very strong decision to remove these taxes because even the expected increase in revenue they are looking for is not there. And also it brings a double taxation because the operators give a certain amount to Government and also declare their revenue monthly as VAT. Remember that they are paying VAT to the regulator and declaring their income at the end of every month. So, that is why it is very bad for the business and movement of people and goods because it makes business more expensive.

Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The Speaker: Thank you. Allow me to invite hon. Kandie because she expressed interest in this very important topic.

The Cabinet Secretary, Ministry of East African Community Affairs, Commerce and Tourism (Kenya) (Ms Phyllis Kandie): Thank you, Madam Speaker for allowing to contribute to the topic. I come to support the adoption of this report because of several issue that, maybe, I cannot raise within the short time that I have in terms supporting this report.

Firstly, as the Minister in Charge of Commerce, I do engage with the private sector all the time and one of the main issues that really come up is how to address ICT in terms of the cost of doing business. The roaming charges within the EAC countries are something that we must address as Partner States. (Applause) The rates are prohibitive to business and I think we are all lying to ourselves if we don’t face this issue head on.
The other issue that I would like to bring up, Madam Speaker is that we are all at different stages of implementing the ICT Policy but I think if the different policy makers or even regulatory bodies could start talking to each other; the learning curve would be shorter for others. We can even make it faster as a region. If we adopt our own strategy, we shall be more marketable as a region as we adopt technology because with technology really we must adopt.

If you some countries including Kenya are already promoting one child one laptop, I think Rwanda is quite a head in this and because we are aware of the fact that our children will have to be technology savvy and they are. So, as Partner States we must respond to this by actually adopting forward looking policies so that we can respond to our children so as to belong to the global community. (Applause)

So, we must fast track this. We don’t have time; we must fast track this and I support this report whole heartedly so that we can move faster.

The other point I would like to make in conclusion is that we must share information as to how to lower the costs of implementing ICT facilities, which are very high.

Secondly, ICT becomes very obsolete quite quickly and so we must share information as Partner States so that we can lower this cost. This should be by helping Partner States not to adopt technology that is obsolete. I know of some countries that have actually done that. There are some marketers who come from the Western world and sell this information to us. And before you know, you have adopted obsolete technology and it is quite expensive.

So, in conclusion, Rt hon. Speaker, I really see this as timely. We don’t have a choice as Partner States. We need to move with the rest of the world and we really need to move faster so that our region becomes more marketable and we can attract more investments in the region. Thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you very much, hon. Kandie. I can see hon. Dora, hon. Abisai, hon. Isabelle and hon. Shy-Rose but I beg that I don’t take their deliberations and I invite the Chair, Council to sum up this debate and then call on the chairperson to wind up debate.

I appreciate- procedure?

Ms Byamukama: Madam Speaker, I have a humble point of procedure. Considering the importance of this subject matter, and taking into account that our recommendations are open ended, I was of the opinion that maybe, if it is supported, that maybe in Kampala we have a substantive report from the Chair, Council of Ministers informing the House on what has been done because this cannot wait. I beg to move.

The Speaker: Basically, that is the recommendation. And once you adopt the report that is what basically the Chair should do. And I think that is part of the report. That is why I want it to be adopted as quickly as possible so that when we are in Kampala, the Chair brings forward what has been done.
Maybe to add that there has been a lot of petitions that have been submitted to us as individual Members and to the Speaker concerning this area. I was happy when the committee undertook to carry out this very important on spot assessment. And I know the recommendations you have given are actually very pertinent. So, I think what is important now is for the Chair, Council to make a comment or two on this report, under study it and make submissions in form of reporting back to the House when we are in Kampala. So, I want to invite you, Chair, Council.

The Chairperson, Council of Ministers (Mr. Shem Bageine): Thank you very much, Madam Speaker.

The Speaker: Hon. Isabelle, how would you like to inform the Chair?

Ms Ndahayo: It is just in addition to what hon. Dora has said and also to some other Members who requested to bring back this debate in Kampala. To me this report is incomplete because it should provide us with sufficient information to allow us assess information and initiatives in all Partner States. And according to this report, there is no information about Burundi and its situation in regard to e-Government and the legal framework about cyber laws. So, I think that we need sufficient information to enable us be able to assess.

The Speaker: Hon. Ndahiro, you would like to give information.

Dr. Ndahiro: Thank you, Rt hon. Speaker. I think the report is complete. What the Member needs to know is – she should have asked why Burundi has not been reported on particularly in those areas. it was deliberately so by the committee because they have not started the process of e-Government and cyber laws. Unless the member wants us, in our report, to cover every Partner State on everything even what they have not yet done. We would have otherwise have come up with a 32 page report.

The Speaker: Thank you. I think what I could guide would be that we could have another motion in Kampala but this doesn’t bar us from adopting this report and then we proceed to have another motion in Kampala and then we debate exhaustively.

That would even answer the concerns of hon. Shy-Rose. Of course, I would appreciate that many more Members would have wished to debate. But of course I can also see - that is why I gave ti an opportunity for it to be read verbatim so that it goes ion the Hansard. That will give us chance to internalize it and then when another motion comes on the floor, either in form of information from the Chair, Council or otherwise, then we shall be able to get more information in that regard. I want now to invite Chair, Council.

The Chairperson, Council of Ministers (Mr. Shem Bageine): Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. I came to agree with observations made by some of our Members to the effect that this being a very important subject, more time should have been available for exhaustive debate so that we are all on the same page and then the Council, of course, would have an opportunity to
internalize what is being said, particularly in the recommendations and how we can implement these recommendations.

Madam Speaker, I agree that the Council of Ministers should be given an opportunity to do a bit of searching and find out what has exactly happened in respective Partner States and come up with a comprehensive report which can be submitted during the next meeting in Kampala.

(Applause)

Madam Speaker, I think this is the way forward and for purposes of procedure, I suppose we can adopt this report and I support it. But we need to do a bit more than what we have done, here, this afternoon. I thank you.

(Applause)

The Speaker: Thank you very much. I agree with your commitment since recommendations 1 and 2 are exactly talking about this particular commitment both on our part as an Assembly and that of Council.

The Chairperson of The Committee on Communications, Trade and Investment (Ms Angela Kizigha): Thank you, Madam Speaker. I thank you once again for giving me this opportunity to acknowledge Members who have contributed to this report especially Chair, Council hon. Kandie, hon. Straton, hon. Yves, hon. Ndahiro, hon. Dora for the point of information, hon. Shy-Rose for a point of information, hon. Isabelle for a point of information and for you, Madam Speaker, personally for having allowed us to continue with this report on Uganda because it is really very important.

It touches the heart of the people in the integration process and also there is a lot, which if we had enough time, we could debate for the benefit of the Members so that we can come up with a proper solution as to how to solve the problem of roaming charges, the problems of EACO and so many others.

I kindly thank you, Madam Speaker, for agreeing that we shall continue debate in Kampala. I beg to support. Thank you.

(Applause)

The Speaker: Thank you very much, Chair of Communications, Trade and Investment. I appreciate that hon. Shy-Rose was so anxious about suspending debate and she fell short of moving under rule 31(c). So, with that I will say that we are going to adopt this report so that the recommendations the committee has put forth can actually be put into consideration.

Hon. Members, the motion on the floor is that the report of the Committee on Communications, Trade and Investment on the On Spot Assessment of Regional Cooperation in the ICT be adopted.
The Speaker: Hon. Members, I would like to appreciate that due to the changes which arose out of our important guests tomorrow, there have been changes within our program. So, the Committee on Communications, Trade and Investment had to do conclude on this report this morning and then it had to be presented this afternoon. So, you find that even in terms of procedure, the motions would have come later than the report. But by the time we started, the report was not yet ready in terms of binding and photocopying. So, I would like you to appreciate and I beg your understanding on this matter.

Secondly, hon. Members, before we conclude our deliberations today, I want to mention that tomorrow is a very important day for us. We are going to receive H.E. the President of the Republic of Kenya amidst us and I want to alert you that the deliberations will take place in the main chamber of the Kenya National Assembly starting at 10.00a.m. We are expected to be seated by 9.40a.m. East African Time.

I want to take the opportunity to extend our condolences to Members of Tanzania upon the loss of the student which has been reported on this floor. Our hearts go to the members of the family and the Government of the United Republic of Tanzania and all the people who have been touched by the loss of this very important East African. We shall continue to commiserate with you and pray that the Lord grants the soul of the departed eternal rest.

Of course issues of security concern all of us. This is an area as you have raised it on the floor-I think the Minister has heard; it should be taken very seriously. Hon. Zein, you have an issue to add because I was winding up?

Mr. Zein: Yes, Madam Speaker, with your kind indulgence because of the changed program if I could announce that we have cancelled the meeting for Regional Affairs and Conflict Resolution to a future date.

The Speaker: Okay, that is important. Hon. Members, thank you very much. With those very many announcements, I would like to adjourn the House. House stands adjourned to tomorrow, 10 O’clock at the Kenya National Assembly Plenary Hall.

(The House rose at .... and adjourned to tomorrow Tuesday 26th November 2013)